



# **RMA/KVNM POSTGRADUATE PROCEEDINGS 2020**



**RMA/KVNM**  
**Postgraduate Proceedings**  
**2020**



**Koninklijke Vereniging voor  
Nederlandse Muziekgeschiedenis**  
(Royal Society for Music History of the Netherlands)  
**2021**

### **Editors of this volume**

Liselotte Podda (coordinator)	(KVNМ, Utrecht University)
Charissa Granger	(Erasmus University)
Núria Bonet	(RMA, University of Plymouth)
Sio Pan Leong	(RMA, University of Edinburgh)
Tamar Hestrin-Grader	(Rijksmuseum, Amsterdam; ACPA, Universiteit Leiden; KASK & Conservatorium, HOГENT-Howest, Ghent)
Veerle Driessen	(KVNМ, Radboud University)

### **RMA/KVNМ Postgraduate Proceedings**

The contributions to this volume have been peer selected by the editors. The authors have been invited to contribute to this first RMA/KVNМ Postgraduate Proceedings, based on submitted proposals for paper presentations at the 2020 KVNМ/RMA International Postgraduate Symposium. This symposium was cancelled due to Covid-19 related restrictions.

### **KVNМ digital proceedings series**

This publication is part of the series of conference and symposium proceedings published digitally and in Open Access by the KVNМ. Series coordinator: Thomas Delpеut (KVNМ, Radboud University)

RMA/KVNМ Postgraduate Proceedings 2020

Koninklijke Vereniging voor Nederlandse Muziekgeschiedenis

Postbus 1514, 3500 BM Utrecht

info@kvnм.nl | kvnm.nl

ISBN 978 906 375 232 3

© 2021 KVNМ

# Contents

<b>Foreword</b>	V
1 "You Know Too Damn Much": Music Theory, Epistemology and the Construction of Musical Identities <i>John Moore</i>	1
2 Hearing Hyrule: Immersion through Sound in <i>The Legend of Zelda: Breath of the Wild</i> <i>Jeff Gu</i>	15
3 Cultural Policy, NGOs, and the Social Integration of Refugees through Music <i>Marthe Holman</i>	31
4 Soviet Remnants in a Post-Soviet World: More Thoughts on the History and Historiography of Russian Music <i>Céleste Pagniello</i>	49
5 <i>The Three-Cornered Hat</i> and Constructions of Spanish Identity <i>Rhiannon Crompton</i>	63
6 The Construction of Beethoven's Myth in China <i>Gangcan Tian</i>	79
7 Marvel and Disguise: Fantastic Musical Instruments in Italian Late Renaissance Theatre Performances <i>Arianna Rigamonti</i>	93
<b>Afterword</b>	113



## Foreword

On behalf of the Royal Musical Association it is a great pleasure to welcome this publication of papers by students of the KVNМ and the RMA. It is truly heartening to see this initiative and such a wide range of scholarship coming forward during these challenging times. The volume is indeed a testimony to our collective determination to advance the best of contemporary musicology by those beginning their scholarly careers, which is assuredly where the future of the discipline lies.

One of the most powerful ways of addressing the challenges we face is through co-operation. The RMA was delighted and honoured to join the celebrations of the KVNМ 150th Anniversary in 2018, which saw the beginning both of student collaborative initiatives and also the founding of the wider Network of European Musicological Societies. By coming together in such ways, we will surely enrich and enhance our research, while at the same time gaining a stronger voice in the cultural and political landscape of a changing Europe.

This splendid volume is witness to this collaborative spirit. My congratulations to all who have contributed—to all those involved in putting the volume together, and above all to every one of the authors. We look forward to following your work in the future and to continuing scholarly collaboration between our two organisations.

*Professor Simon McVeigh*

*Immediate Past President, Royal Musical Association (RMA)*

On behalf of the Royal Society for Music History of the Netherlands (KVNМ) I wish to express our great pleasure now that this proceedings of conference papers by young researchers of the United Kingdom and the Netherlands is available. We are proud of this joined initiative of postgraduates from the RMA and the KVNМ. It is an inspiring step towards more regular international cooperation between musicological societies, an aim made explicit during the 2018 KVNМ jubilee symposium in Utrecht. We look forward to a follow up to this wonderful initiative in the near future.

The contributions in this volume show variety not only in the wide range of topics that young scholars within the field of musicology are working on today, but also in the approaches that are used. Therefore, it is without doubt that these papers are valuable to new and established researchers in the different respective fields. We congratulate the authors and greatly thank the editors of this volume.

*Dr. Désirée Staverman*

*President, Royal Society for Music History of The Netherlands (KVNМ)*







## "You Know Too Damn Much"

### *Music Theory Knowledge as a Para-Musical Component in the Construction of Identities*

*John Moore*

#### **Abstract**

Music theory is a rarefied discipline; of this, there can be little dispute. However, given music's ubiquitous place in society and culture, the tendency in mass media towards the obfuscation of musical knowledge, as opposed to any kind of candid explanation, is somewhat striking. O'Hara (2018) suggests that public-facing discourses concerning music theory in the age of the internet present music theory both as a scientifically rigorous and unified body of research; and a proverbial fount of arcane wisdom, available only to the select few who are able to pierce its abstruse and mysterious veil. While this certainly seems to hold true in the modern "regime of the think-piece", we must question the origin of this new epistemology of music theory and why this portrayal seems to be so pervasive in popular culture. By examining a range of audio-visual media, primarily focussing on television, this paper examines the various ways in which music theory, and the *techné* of music, is portrayed to the general public. Building upon the work of Greene (2002), I will examine how "ideologies of authenticity" fuel particular attitudes towards—and presentations of—technical knowledge of musical processes. In addition to this, I will discuss the extent to which music theoretical knowledge features as a component in the para-musical makeup of certain genres and styles; and, by extension, how this contributes to the construction of identities for both artists and fans in musical subcultures.

### **Biography**

**John Moore** is a PhD candidate at the University of Liverpool under the supervision of Professor Kenneth Smith and Dr. Richard Worth. He is a former high school teacher and Head of Music at Sir John Talbot's School in Shropshire and also works as a music subject specialist for the University of Chester's postgraduate teacher training programme. John's research focuses on the language of music theory, digital subcultures and music education with a particular focus on YouTube. His work has been presented at numerous conferences in the UK, Ireland, the Netherlands and Portugal.

**Keywords:** music theory, identity, pedagogy, genre, YouTube

**Affiliation:** PhD Candidate, University of Liverpool, United Kingdom

**Email address:** moorecj@liverpool.ac.uk

## Introduction

Music theory is a rarefied discipline; of this, there can be little dispute. However, given music's ubiquitous place in society and culture, the tendency in mass media towards the obfuscation of musical knowledge, as opposed to any kind of candid explanation, is somewhat striking. O'Hara suggests that public-facing discourses concerning music theory in the age of the internet present music theory both as a scientifically rigorous and unified body of research; as well as a proverbial fount of arcane wisdom, available only to the select few who are able to pierce its abstruse and mysterious veil.<sup>1</sup> While this certainly seems to hold true in the modern "regime of the think-piece", we must question the origin of this new epistemology of music theory and why this portrayal seems to be so pervasive in popular culture.<sup>2</sup>

Using three case studies, this paper examines the various ways in which music theory, and the *techné* of music, is portrayed to the general public.<sup>3</sup> Through a critical examination of the work of Lucy Green I will suggest that "ideologies of authenticity" fuel particular attitudes towards—and presentations of—technical knowledge of musical processes.<sup>4</sup> In addition to this, I will discuss the extent to which music theoretical knowledge features as a component in the para-musical makeup of certain genres; and, by extension, how this contributes to the construction of identities for both artists and fans in musical subcultures.

Firstly, we will consider an interview with Paul Simon on *The Dick Cavett Show* in 1975; secondly, an interview with Foo Fighters frontman Dave Grohl on *Off Camera with Sam Jones* from 2014; and lastly, a post-audition exchange between *American Idol* judges Harry

---

<sup>1</sup> William O'Hara, "Music Theory and the Epistemology of the Internet", *Analitica: Rivista online di studi musicali* 10 (2018).

<sup>2</sup> Ibid.

<sup>3</sup> I will be using 'music theory' primarily in the 'how to' or *techné* sense. This term, broadly definable as 'craft', deals with the processes of music creation and is particularly useful here as it encompasses tacit music theoretical knowledge as well as dealing with the active processes of knowledge acquisition and music creation.

<sup>4</sup> Lucy Green, *How Popular Musicians Learn: A Way Ahead for Music Education* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2002) 103.

Connick Jr. and Jennifer Lopez from the show's thirteenth season in 2013. All three cases were aired on major US television networks in their respective years of release but have also gained greater popularity in recent years having been uploaded to the internet. The clips that I will be discussing are taken directly from YouTube. It is worth mentioning to the reader at this point that viewing these three videos is essential for a thorough understanding of the discussion. In the interests of brevity, I have not fully reproduced transcripts of the discussions; information on where to find these clips is available in the footnotes.

### **Paul Simon on *The Dick Cavett Show* (1975)**

Paul Simon, famous as one half of the internationally acclaimed duo *Simon and Garfunkel*, appeared on *The Dick Cavett Show* on several occasions during the height of his career in the 1970s.<sup>5</sup> During several of these interviews, Simon, guitar in hand, discusses his songwriting process, including some particularly memorable moments where the latter deconstructs hit songs such as *Bridge Over Troubled Water* (1970) and *Mrs. Robinson* (1968).

During one of these appearances, Simon performs a—then unfinished—version of his 1975 song *Still Crazy After All These Years*.<sup>6</sup> Simon begins by explaining that he has been working on a song but is 'stuck' and unsure of how to progress. Cavett proposes that Simon play the song up until the section that is causing him difficulty. After performing up to the point in question, Simon pauses and pointedly

---

<sup>5</sup> The Dick Cavett Show was a popular US television show which aired on a number of networks including ABC, PBS, USA and CNBC from 1968-1995. Known for his approachable manner and candid questioning style, presenter Dick Cavett interviewed countless influential figures in popular culture over the course of his long career on television.

<sup>6</sup> *Still Crazy After All These Years* is the title track from Simon's 1975 album released by Columbia Records. The song entered the top 40 of the Billboard Top 100 briefly in the year it was released but was more successful in the magazines 'Easy Listening Chart' where it peaked at number 4.

strums the final chord (D9). What is interesting here is the exchange that follows: here, the reader is advised to watch the clip.<sup>7</sup>

Simon's use of the word "choices" in the clip is significant. Implicit in his suggestions of several different chord options from which Cavett can choose, is the understanding that these choices exist within a tonal theoretical framework and there the possibilities for which chord should follow the D9 are not limitless. This is exemplified later in the discussion when he says: "Now two notes that I haven't used in the song so far, a C natural and C sharp...if I go to this key...I can get these notes in that I haven't used...and although the listener will not ever consciously say 'those are two new notes I haven't heard'...it will be refreshing to the ear."<sup>8</sup>

When the conversation begins to turn toward music theory, Cavett begins to employ the use of humour, "I would have gone for a D8 personally, but that's fine", possibly sensing the potential for the audience to feel alienated by the use of music theoretical jargon.<sup>9</sup> Sensing the unlikelihood that the audience will understand much of this jargon, Cavett ingratiate himself to his audience using humour wherever possible. In other words, Cavett's reaction highlights the fact that it is common knowledge that music theory is *not* common knowledge.

### **Harry Connick Jr., *American Idol* and pentatonics**

American musician and television host Harry Connick Jr. featured in the thirteenth season (2013) of popular US television talent show *American Idol* as a guest judge alongside Jennifer Lopez and Keith Urban. Following one audition early in the season, Connick Jr. comments on a contestant's performance stating, "I'm not as taken by the smoke and mirrors of pentatonics as these two [gesturing to Lopez and Urban]."<sup>10</sup> The camera then pans to the contestant, who appears

---

<sup>7</sup> Cavettbiter, "Paul Simon performs a partially-written STILL CRAZY," uploaded April 2008, video, 4:54, [https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=jjtOa8d\\_BHU..](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=jjtOa8d_BHU..)

<sup>8</sup> Cavettbiter, "Paul Simon."

<sup>9</sup> Ibid.

<sup>10</sup> Beantown Swing Orchestra, "Harry Connick, Jr. Teaches Jennifer Lopez About Pentatonics," uploaded January 2014, video, 1:38,

to be utterly perplexed by Connick’s comment. At the same time, a flurry of incredulous “whats?” are issued by both the contestant and other judges before the camera shows the contestant leaving the room.

Lopez’s cavalier and flippant attitude towards the discussion of music theory in this context is not entirely uncommon. This contrasts with Cavett’s exchange, where he aims to ‘bring the audience in’ rather than simply dismissing the speaker. The “you know too damn much” quip, while intended as humour, is nonetheless somewhat sneering, and Lopez’s manner is clearly defensive when suggesting that this terminology will be challenging to the American public.

### **Dave Grohl on Off Camera with Sam Jones (2014)**

In an interview with photographer and director Sam Jones, former *Nirvana* drummer and *Foo-Fighters* frontman Dave Grohl discusses his experiences of learning to play drums and guitar as well as offering his opinions on formal music tuition. In addition to being aired on the US *Audience* TV network, *Off Camera* hosts a YouTube channel featuring clips from the show’s interviews. The excerpt from the Dave Grohl interview under scrutiny here is published under the name *Dave Grohl Proves You Don’t Need Lessons to Rock*. The title of this video is in itself representative of the idea, often closely associated with rock music, that autodidacticism is the prevailing pathway to authenticity as a practitioner in the genre; a point which we will discuss in some detail later.

Grohl opens with a discussion of how he learned to play his main instruments and is critical of formal music lessons, recounting an incident where a drum teacher had criticised the way Grohl had held his sticks resulting in the latter never returning. He expresses similar sentiments when discussing his experiences of learning to play the guitar:

---

[https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=pH9l8KlcuBA&ab\\_channel=BeantownSwingOrchestra](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=pH9l8KlcuBA&ab_channel=BeantownSwingOrchestra)



Same with guitar, I mean, I took a couple of guitar lessons and then I wound up playing...and I play guitar the way I do it. I don't know what any of the chords really are...<sup>11</sup>

Grohl then plays a few excerpts from popular Foo Fighter's tracks, emphasising the apparent percussive quality of the riffs resulting from his unique approach to learning based on his background in drums. This entire exchange is a fairly concrete example of the rock 'ideology of authenticity' in action. This idea is explored in some detail by Lucy Green in her extensive study of the learning processes and practices of amateur popular musicians. In the fourth chapter of her study, Green juxtaposes two modes of learning: one via *discipline*, most often associated with formal education and art music; and the other via *osmosis*, most often associated with 'organic' learning, autodidactic practices and popular musics. While accepting that classical music learning is more associated with "disciplined" study, and that popular music is normally more "osmotic."<sup>12</sup> Green goes on to detail an "ideological syndrome" known as the "ideology of authenticity."<sup>13</sup> The basic idea behind this involves "assuming 'authenticity' by *pretending* that 'it all comes naturally' and attempting to appear 'cool' by disguising the hard grind that goes into the acquisition of knowledge and skills."<sup>14</sup> Green is dismissive of this description of learning, stating that "none of the fourteen randomly selected musicians I interviewed displayed such a tendency" and that the "adoption of such an ideology is a habit of rock fans and journalists", however, the evidence that she proposes to refute this is not exactly compelling.<sup>15</sup>

Indeed, there are numerous occasions throughout the text where participants seem to openly espouse this very ideology:

---

<sup>11</sup> Theoffcamerashow, "Dave Grohl Proves You Don't Need Lessons to Rock," uploaded July 2013, video, 2:42, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ixo-MQ0u6SA>, 0:23-0:49

<sup>12</sup> Green, *How Popular Musicians Learn*, 103.

<sup>13</sup> Ibid.

<sup>14</sup> Ibid, 66.

<sup>15</sup> Ibid.

“During a discussion of how he had acquired technique, to be considered later, Terry volunteered that it was just... ‘whatever came naturally really.’”<sup>16</sup> I believe that Green’s antagonism towards this idea is somewhat misplaced; I would suggest that the “ideology that rock musicians are more ‘authentic’ when they play without conscious design” is not necessarily held by individual rock musicians when it comes to their *learning* practices, but it *is* one that rock musicians are keen to project publicly, and interpersonally.<sup>17</sup> Put another way, I can readily understand how Green concluded that the musicians in her sample were not operating under such an ideological framework when it came to their individual knowledge acquisition, however, this seemed only became apparent after careful questioning and ‘drawing out’ of information on the author’s part. Indeed, my hypothesis would appear to be confirmed in by Green herself later “the level of systematization [in their learning practices] seems to have become increasingly apparent to the musicians as time went by.”<sup>18</sup>

We see this in action in with Grohl: “But I mean, nobody taught me how to do that, I just sorta thought ‘oh, that sounds good.’”<sup>19</sup> Similar sentiments are echoed by the participants in Green’s research and it becomes increasingly clear that autodidacticism is an important feature of this ‘ideology of authenticity’:

The ideology of rock authenticity arises in part precisely from the fact that the musicians have acquired their skills largely outside of formal education, which lends the appearance of not having ever consciously or purposefully ‘learnt’ them at all. For example, quite a few of the musicians in this study stated that they ‘had not *learnt*’ something, meaning they had not *been taught* it.<sup>20</sup>

---

<sup>16</sup> Green, *How Popular Musicians Learn*, 65.

<sup>17</sup> Ibid, 100.

<sup>18</sup> Green, *How Popular Musicians Learn*, 103.

<sup>19</sup> Theoffcamerashow, “Dave Grohl”.

<sup>20</sup> Green, *How Popular Musicians Learn*, 103.

So, the question remains, how prevalent is this ideology of authenticity and how does it manifest itself in rock artists and fans? This is, of course, a difficult question to answer conclusively, but my initial research suggests that an individual's presentation of their level of music theory and/or *techné* knowledge is an important factor in the para-musical makeup of rock as a genre, or rather with their personal identification with the subculture of rock. That is, for many rock practitioners their autodidactic roots; 'osmotic' learning practices; and a collective shunning of formalised education, seem to feature prominently in the construction of their musical identity. The key takeaway point here, which Green fails to recognise, is that this ideology is not necessarily a deeply held belief evidenced in the practices of rock musicians, but rather a public front which exists due to its inherent resonance with rock's reputation as an 'outsider' genre which values individualism, personal freedoms and anti-establishment ideals.

Grohl clearly situates himself within this ideology, disparaging structured and/or formal music learning practices in favour of autodidacticism. That being said, there are several moments in the interview where Grohl 'gives himself away', so to speak, revealing that he perhaps has more knowledge about his craft than he cares to publicly admit. For instance, later, he mentions using "suspended notes", clearly demonstrating some knowledge of a music theoretical principle, but he is quick to 'save face' hurriedly following his comment with "nobody taught me how to do that."<sup>21</sup>

## Discussion

From these case studies, we have seen three quite distinct presentations of music theoretical knowledge and/or *techné* on the public stage. It has become clear throughout this examination that certain trends emerge with regard to the presentation of such knowledge in relation to the genres within which these artists operate. Paul Simon, most often described as a singer-songwriter, is clearly concerned with the *techné* of song-writing and is very happy to include

---

<sup>21</sup> Theoffcamerashow, "Dave Grohl".

music theory in the discussion of his craft. Indeed, later in the same interview, the following exchange occurs:

**Cavett:** Say, I know something about you, that you’re studying music *seriously* now, which I find sort of touching...

**Simon:** I am, yeah, but it’s not exactly accurate to say that I’m studying seriously because I was always serious about it. I’m just directing it in a more...more disciplined way I think.<sup>22</sup>

Simon readily acknowledges his commitment to the ‘disciplined’ study of music and is somewhat perturbed at the suggestion that he was not a ‘serious’ musician before focussing his efforts in this way. In short, Simon’s discussions and demonstrations of the *techné* of song-writing marry quite comfortably with his image and musical identity in the genres of easy listening or folk-pop. Fans of Simon’s music, or similar artists within these genres, are not typically associated with a particular subcultural group, or as having a set of homogeneous characteristics in the same way that genres such as rock and metal do. Simon’s musical knowledge, therefore, is likely to have little bearing on someone identifying as a Paul Simon fan. Put another way, Simon’s ‘authenticity’ as an artist is not linked with the characteristics of a particular subcultural group, therefore, neither his knowledge, nor the means by which he acquired it, are of much consequence.

Dave Grohl’s presentation of his musical knowledge, on the other hand, sits in direct opposition to this. Grohl is keen to downplay his knowledge and is openly critical of formalised learning practices, favouring an autodidactic approach. Grohl’s attitudes are broadly consistent with those described in Green’s study, where popular and rock musicians are less likely to identify with formal education in music and tend toward learning by ‘osmosis’.<sup>23</sup> Methods of acquisition aside, Grohl is keen to portray himself as having very little musical

---

<sup>22</sup> Cavettbiter, “Paul Simon.”

<sup>23</sup> Green, *How Popular Musicians Learn*, 103.

knowledge: “I don’t really know what any of the chords are”; while this is of course *possible*, it is difficult to accept that a musician of Grohl’s standing, with decades of experience in the industry in a number of culturally significant musical outfits has not acquired some knowledge of guitar chords.<sup>24</sup> Also, even if Grohl is unable to accurately name chords, this does not necessarily diminish his musical knowledge, as Green puts it: “just because the musicians are not necessarily able to talk about or name musical procedures and elements...it does not follow that they should conceive of themselves as ‘not knowing’ about them. Rather, they have ‘tacit’ knowledge of them.”<sup>25</sup> For the present discussion, whether Grohl actually *possesses* this knowledge—tacit or otherwise—is less important than how he portrays himself in relation to this knowledge.

So why is Grohl concerned with this at all? Why does he seem to care so much when Simon does not? The simple answer is: authenticity. Paul Simon’s music, in terms of its genre and style, are not tied to an ideological framework, whereas Grohl comes from a musical tradition where authenticity is key. Simon Frith describes this in more detail:

The defining term in rock ideology is authenticity. Rock is distinguished from pop as the authentic expression of a performer’s or composer’s feelings and the authentic representation of a social situation. Rock is at once the mainstream of commercial music and a romantic art form, a voice from the social margins.<sup>26</sup>

Rock and its associated subgenres engender the creation of clearly defined subcultural groups. Members of these groups are more likely to display a range of extramusical attributes which serve to further align them with the subculture. These attributes could be anything from dress sense and hairstyles to political leanings and spiritual

---

<sup>24</sup> Theoffcamerashow, “Dave Grohl”.

<sup>25</sup> Green, *How Popular Musicians Learn*, 103.

<sup>26</sup> Simon Frith, “Rock - Authenticity and commercialism,” accessed June 27, 2020, <https://www.britannica.com/art/rock-music/Authenticity-and-commercialism>.

beliefs. My suggestion here is that Grohl’s comments on his musical knowledge are just one such attribute that both feeds his image and solidifies his alignment with the rock ideology of authenticity.

Like Simon, Connick holds theory in high regard: “what’s wrong with challenging America?”<sup>27</sup> As I discussed earlier, the key difference between the two cases lies not with Connick or Simon but rather with Lopez and Cavett and the contrasting ways in which they handle being confronted with unfamiliar terminology. That aside, it could be argued that Connick’s presentation of his musical knowledge is antithetical to Grohl’s, given that he is most closely associated with the jazz tradition where attitudes towards theory are quite different from that discussed in relation to rock. While the jazz tradition does not make much distinction between the method of knowledge acquisition, it does place great emphasis on the knowledge itself. In other words, where a rock musician *may* wear their autodidactic roots and limited terminological proficiency as a badge of authenticity, the same could not be said for jazz.<sup>28</sup> Owing to the more sophisticated harmonic vocabulary of the genre (ordinarily), along with a strong focus on improvisation, jazz musicians tend to have a more comprehensive grasp of music theoretical terminology than rock musicians, as this is often a necessary component of their learning processes. It could therefore be argued that both Connick and Grohl are displaying these divergent attitudes towards musical knowledge in the pursuit of authenticity in the respective musical traditions to which they belong.

In conclusion, it has become clear throughout my discussion of these case studies that music theoretical knowledge and/or *techné* is an important factor in the construction of identities within particular musical subcultures. This idea has not, to the best of my knowledge, been discussed in great detail within the literature and warrants

---

<sup>27</sup> Beantown Swing Orchestra, “Harry Connick, Jr.”

<sup>28</sup> It should be noted here that I am of course not treating all rock musicians as one unified group but am rather suggesting the propensity for rock musicians to display these characteristics owing to their potential alignment with the rock ideology of authenticity; such is the case for the participants in Green’s research.

further exploration. In her discussion of how music materialises identities Georgina Born says the following:

Music has no material essence but a plural and distributed materiality. Its multiple simultaneous forms of existence—as sonic trace, discursive exegesis, notated score, technological prosthesis, social and embodied performance—indicate the necessity of conceiving of the musical object as a constellation of mediations.<sup>29</sup>

If we apply these sentiments to musical group identities and not just to musical objects, it still holds true. Musical identity construction, and the para-musical assemblage of genre, is not a single entity but a constellation of mediations, within which music theoretical knowledge is a significant element.

---

<sup>29</sup> Georgina Born, “Music and the materialization of identities” *Journal of Material Culture* 16, no 4 (2001): 377

## Bibliography

- Berkaak, Odd Are. "Entangled dreams and twisted memories: order and disruption in local music making" *Nordic Journal of Youth Research* 7, no.2 (1999): 25-42.
- Born, Georgina. "Music and the materialization of identities" *Journal of Material Culture* 16, no 4 (2001): 376-388.
- Cook, Nicholas. *The Cambridge Companion to Music in Digital Culture*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2019.
- Fallows, David. "Theory" in *The Oxford Companion to Music*." Accessed June 27, 2020. <https://www.oxfordreference.com/view/10.1093/acref/9780199579037.001.0001/acref-9780199579037-e-6759?rskey=381E0i&result=1>.
- Frith, Simon. "Rock - Authenticity and commercialism" Accessed June 27, 2020. <https://www.britannica.com/art/rock-music/Authenticity-and-commercialism>.
- Green, Lucy. *How Popular Musicians Learn: A Way Ahead for Music Education*. Aldershot: Ashgate. 2002.
- Jones, Sam. "About" Accessed June 27, 2020. <https://www.samjonespictures.com/About/Bio/1>.
- O'Hara, William. "Music Theory and the Epistemology of the Internet", *Analitica: Rivista online di studi musicali* 10 (2018).
- Wikipedia. "The Dick Cavett Show" Accessed June 27, 2020. [https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/The\\_Dick\\_Cavett\\_Show](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/The_Dick_Cavett_Show).

## Videography

- Beantown Swing Orchestra. "Harry Connick, Jr. Teaches Jennifer Lopez About Pentatonics" Uploaded January 2014. Video, 1:38, [https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=pH9l8KlcuBA&ab\\_channel=BeantownSwingOrchestra](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=pH9l8KlcuBA&ab_channel=BeantownSwingOrchestra).
- Cavettbiter. "Paul Simon performs a partially-written STILL CRAZY" Uploaded April 2008. Video, 4:54, [https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=jjtOa8d\\_BHU](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=jjtOa8d_BHU).
- Theoffcamerashow. "Dave Grohl Proves You Don't Need Lessons to Roc" Uploaded July 2013. Video, 2:42, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ixo-MQ0u6SA>.



## 2

### Hearing Hyrule

#### *Immersion through Sound in The Legend of Zelda: Breath of the Wild*

*Jeff Gu*

#### **Abstract**

Not only did 2017's long awaited *The Legend of Zelda: Breath of the Wild* (BOTW) garner much attention for its break from the linear gameplay that came to characterise Nintendo's *The Legend of Zelda* franchise, it also presented an audio design completely distinct from previous instalments. Though the relatively recent academic field of ludomusicology mostly analyses musicality in video games such as *Guitar Hero* and *Wii Music* in which the software scores player performances, I scrutinise elements of BOTW's sound scheme to demonstrate ways in which ludomusicology can expand in the future. Using Isabella van Elferen's ALI framework on video game sound design, I analyse the phenomenology of immersion within BOTW's settings, closely examining how musical Affect, Literacy, and Interaction contribute to the player's ludic experience. These avenues of analysing the structures of experience respectively investigate affect via ambient sound, literacy through medium and franchise familiarity, and interaction by way of triggering unusual sonic events and combat sounds to contribute to the new discipline of ludomusicology with an even newer case study. My musicological analysis drawn from van Elferen's theoretical framework showcases how the most recent instalment of the Zelda main series broadens the scope of analysis for future ludomusicology scholarship. Press Start

### **Biography**

**Jeff Gu** is from Toronto and studied Spanish, Arabic, and cultural studies at UCL before obtaining his Master of Philosophy in Music at the University of Cambridge. His musicology interests include ludomusicology, queer hip hop, Chinese rock, and his specialty of Afrofuturism. Identifying as ethnic minority Chinese Canadian, Jeff digs modern art, thrift stores, and 70s funk. When he is not playing video games, rugby or his ukulele, he is likely napping or trying to convince the world that it is better than sleep.

**Keywords:** Zelda, sound design, music, video games, immersion

**Affiliation:** University of Cambridge, Cambridge, United Kingdom

**Email:** jg928@cantab.ac.uk

## Press Start

The year 2017 witnessed the release of the Nintendo Switch and its launch title, *The Legend of Zelda: Breath of the Wild* (BOTW). Since the series inception in 1986, this newest instalment garnered much attention for its break from the linear gameplay that came to define the franchise. Lauded as a ‘watershed game that reinvents a 30-year-old franchise,’<sup>1</sup> the game also notably subverts another series trope by reinventing its sound scheme. This innovation resulted in critical acclaim and nominations for Best Score/Music and Best Audio Design at The Game Awards 2017 among numerous other accolades.

The realms of musicology and sound studies in recent years have observed an active push led by scholars such as William Cheng, Michiel Kamp, and Tim Summers to include video game music in academic discussion; this theoretical movement birthed the subdivision of ludomusicology. Though the discipline mostly analyses musicality in video games such as *Guitar Hero* and *Wii Music*, in which the software scores player performances, Cheng wonders if a different kind of ludomusicology is possible. Instead of ‘critical missions that get mired in agonism, definitional boundaries, and high scores,’ he longs for ‘a ludomusicology that bounces along feelings of musicality, pleasure, and imagination.’<sup>2</sup> In support of this proposition, my essay scrutinises elements of BOTW’s sound design to propose how ludomusicology can expand. Using Isabella van Elferen’s ALI framework, I analyse the phenomenology of immersion within the game’s settings, closely examining how musical Affect, Literacy, and Interaction contribute to the player’s ludic experience. These avenues of analysing the structures of experience respectively investigate affect via ambient sound, literacy through medium and franchise familiarity, and interaction by way of unusual sonic events and combat sounds to contribute to the newer discipline of ludomusicology.

---

<sup>1</sup> Jose Otero, “The Legend of Zelda: Breath of the Wild Review,” *IGN*, last modified September 14, 2017, <https://www.ign.com/articles/2017/03/02/the-legend-of-zelda-breath-of-the-wild-review>.

<sup>2</sup> William Cheng, “Afterword — Toadofsky’s Music Lessons,” in *Music Video Games: Performance, Politics, and Play*, ed. Michael Austin (New York: Bloomsbury Academic, 2016), 297–303.

**'It's dangerous to go alone! Take this.'**

Game critics have increasingly described narrative video games as cinematic pieces that afford players agency since they are the ones who trigger in-game events. Thus, when ludomusicologists first started analysing game music, they turned to film studies for theory to adapt. In video games, storytelling has greatly evolved through progressively complex plotlines and multiple possible endings while graphics have sharpened along with the exponential nature of technological development. Fittingly, the sheer number of video game franchises that have expanded to television and film in recent years is telling of how enmeshed the genres have become, so when ludomusicologists first started analysing game music, they turned to film studies for theory to adapt. As Summers argues, however, the aesthetic dominance of music in video games 'often appears to have greater priority than in film'<sup>3</sup> as music often directly contributes to integrating ludic components and narrative elements, resulting in its higher potential to contribute to the player's experience.

To scrutinise the phenomenology of gameplay, the SCI model emerged as the first multi-dimensional analysis of video game immersion as 'a heuristic representation of key elements that structure the gameplay experience.'<sup>4</sup> Claiming to draw attention to the complex dynamics between the player and the game, Laura Ermi and Frans Mäyrä describe their structure as a combination of Sensory, Challenge-based, and Imaginative immersions. However, they admit that SCI is not a comprehensive model of analysis since 'The complex internal organization of a "game" and a "player" in particular are left schematic'<sup>5</sup> to focus on the consciousness structured by the interplay. In supplement, van Elferen builds on the model by proposing the ALI

---

<sup>3</sup> Tim Summers, *Understanding Video Game Music* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016), 176.

<sup>4</sup> Laura Ermi and Frans Mäyrä, "Fundamental Components of the Gameplay Experience: Analysing Immersion," in *DIGAREC Keynote-Lectures 2009/10*, ed. Stephan Günzel, Michael Liebe, and Dieter Mersch (Potsdam: University Press, 2011), 88–115.

<sup>5</sup> *Ibid.*, 101.

method, integrating emotional aspects of musical immersion into the SCI model. She proposes that analysis on gameplay immersion should focus more on musical Affect, Literacy and Interaction to better define 'game musical player involvement.'<sup>6</sup> As her paper only investigated sonic immersion in survival and psychological horror games, she acknowledges that her preliminary observations would benefit from further research as 'a range of different game genres could test the model's components in various contexts.'<sup>7</sup> Thus wielding ALI as our primary weapon, albeit never before assessed in the open world genre nor gifted from an old man in a cave, may we slice our way through thickets and enemies on our quest to explore how sound in *BOTW* immerses the player in Hyrule.

### Running Wild

Whether scaling cliffs by waterfalls or rafting to uncharted islands, gamers explore the digital landscape designed by the *BOTW* developers as intrepid adventurers. Though the creator of the *Zelda* series, Shigeru Miyamoto, did not actively contribute to developing *BOTW*'s development, his principles remain central to its production. In terms of design, 'what draws his work together is an extreme attention to detail concerning the entire immersive environment,'<sup>8</sup> of which components notably include music. In the century that the hero Link was set to sleep, Calamity Ganon has blighted Hyrule and slaughtered its populations, leaving behind vast landscapes with sparse settlements. Although critical reviews primarily applaud the franchise's new open world concept, they do not discount the soundscape's instrumental role in immersing the players:

While running through the picturesque green fields of Hyrule, a massive storm unexpectedly rolled in. As heavy rain began

---

<sup>6</sup> Isabella van Elferen, "Analysing Game Musical Immersion: The ALI Model," in *Ludomusicology: Approaches to Video Game Music*, ed. Michiel Kamp, Tim Summers, and Mark Sweeney (Sheffield: Equinox Publishing, 2016), 32–52.

<sup>7</sup> *Ibid.*, 49.

<sup>8</sup> Jennifer DeWinter, *Shigeru Miyamoto: Super Mario Bros., Donkey Kong, The Legend of Zelda* (New York: Bloomsbury Academic, 2015), 25.

to pour, a strong wind rustled the tall grass, and in the distance I could hear the crack of lightning. The sharp sound rapidly came closer and closer until *zap!* I was electrocuted to death [*sic*] by a bolt.<sup>9</sup>

As affect research in ludology is defined to investigate 'cognition, emotion, and goal-oriented behaviour of players,'<sup>10</sup> the importance placed on environmental sound in *BOTW*'s audio design is instrumental in guiding players in their journey. Indeed, environmental sound has had a long history in the franchise: even the first 3D Zelda game, *The Ocarina of Time* (1998), featured a day-night divide with birdsong or crickets depending on the timer. In *BOTW*, adaptive environmental sounds accompany the player throughout the gameplay as much of the experience takes place in the wilderness. The prominent role of weather and wildlife sounds creates an environment distinct from other Zelda instalments with ambient sound functioning as a multimedia interaction constructed within a designated context to construct meaning. Supporting this notion, 'the effects that the audio engineers go to in placing and balancing the plethora of diegetic sounds in video games are testament to the fact that they are a purposeful and meaningful contribution to the games' narratives.'<sup>11</sup> In *BOTW*, the ubiquity of nature sounds denotes a sense of tranquillity tinged with melancholy as Link relearns his surroundings and combat skills lost to amnesia.

However, some fans did not welcome this stylistic change in audio design as they longed for the heroic 'overworld' theme characteristic of the franchise. Contrary to in previous Zelda games,

---

<sup>9</sup> Andrew Webster, "The Legend of Zelda: Breath of the Wild Review," *The Verge*, March 2, 2017, <https://www.theverge.com/2017/3/2/14787082/the-legend-of-zelda-breath-of-the-wild-review>.

<sup>10</sup> Lennart E. Nacke, Sophie Stellmach, and Craig A. Linley, "Electroencephalographic Assessment of Player Experience: A Pilot Study in Affective Ludology," *Simulation & Gaming* 42, no. 5 (2010): 3.

<sup>11</sup> Mark Sweeney, "Isaac's Silence: Purposive Aesthetics in *Dead Space*," in *Ludomusicology: Approaches to Video Game Music*, ed. Michiel Kamp, Tim Summers, and Mark Sweeney (Sheffield: Equinox Publishing, 2016), 172–97.

Manaka Kataoka, one of the soundtrack's composers, withholds grandiose melodies from players, affecting the game's overall tone. A fan summarises: 'People who wanted louder, grander music don't realise that this wouldn't have suited this particular game . . . Nintendo wanted you to focus on the environmental noise and sounds, and the quiet, devastated ruins of Hyrule.'<sup>12</sup> Additionally, instead of looping background tracks like in other *Zelda* games, the *BOTW* soundtrack tends to fade to silence, leaving behind only ambient sounds and Link's footsteps on various terrains to immerse the player in their surroundings. Even when Link crouches to avoid detection, the game lowers the music volume in favour of emphasizing acousmatic sound effects. These minute sonic elements contribute greatly to immersion in *BOTW*, a key component to its phenomenological design.

Though sound engineers accentuated the prominence of ambient sound in *BOTW*, diegetic music still plays an important role in the game. Layering upon local ambient sound and minimal non-diegetic music, the game often features another diegetic acoustic dimension, the most notable example of which is the travelling bard, Kass, an anthropomorphic avian creature who roams Hyrule, singing songs of the land. His accordion accompanies him on his travels and he only stops performing his looping theme when Link speaks to him, allowing the player to request he perform the untitled history of the Great Calamity. Apart from being a keeper of mythology, Kass is also responsible for initiating many of Link's shrine quests, extra puzzles that the player may complete for rewards. However, since Kass's locations are not marked on the map, whenever players hear faint accordion music playing 'Kass's Theme,' they are encouraged to follow the sound to its source, where the volume gradually reaches its loudest by the minstrel. Only then will Kass recite ancient verses from the region, offering clues to locate the hidden shrine. Following sound to its source is not new in the *Zelda* universe; Elizabeth Medina-Grey describes the *Wind Waker* (2002) quest of seeking Medli playing the

---

<sup>12</sup> Lach D, November 9, 2017 (5:39 a.m.), comment on Game Maker's Toolkit, "The Music of Breath of the Wild | GMTK Extra," <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=3FWVKu1gnWs&lc=UgzndpAxUDL-PlqEdyJ4AaABAg>.

harp on Dragon Roost Island. Upon docking on the shore, Link must follow the faint harp chords to find her. The mere presence of harp music layered on the island's theme conveys much information to the player: the sound event is unusual since this setting does not normally feature any harp music. The changing volume of the harp sounds provides constant sonic clues for Link to follow while the music's acousmatic aspect motivates 'curiosity to find the source of the sound.'<sup>13</sup> Back to *BOTW*, Kass is not the only instance where the music increases in volume as the player approaches the source; regional horse stables and the elusive Fang and Bone shop are all locations where players must draw from sound cues to locate the origin.

This layering of localised sound over a ubiquitous environmental sound in *BOTW* appeals to the player's ludological affect via cognition, emotion, and goal-oriented behaviour in the digital soundscape. A potential route for future ludomusicological discussion could be developing frameworks to analyse the digital environment itself as an affective sound object.

### **'Hey! Listen!'**

In this section analysing how background knowledge affects immersion, I treat 'literacy' in two senses: ludoliteracy, meaning understanding sonic conventions in video games, and franchisal literacy, familiarity with the game series. As van Elferen explains, in 'Combining the audio-visual literacies of film and television music with ludoliteracy, game soundtrack design appeals to a specific game musical literacy.'<sup>14</sup> For example, 'Win' cues briefly congratulate the player while 'Lose' cues offer a moment to reflect upon failures before asking they try again. Common cues in *BOTW* include the piercing 'headshot' sound and various 'acquisition' tunes, from less consequential items to prized treasures important to the narrative. These signs immerse players within the experience as they 'interpret

---

<sup>13</sup> Elizabeth Medina-Grey, "Meaningful Modular Combinations: Simultaneous Harp and Environmental Music in Two *Legend of Zelda* Games," in *Music in Video Games: Studying Play*, ed. K.J. Donnelly, William Gibbons, and Neil Lerner (New York: Routledge, 2014), 104–21.

<sup>14</sup> van Elferen, "Analysing Game Musical Immersion," 36.



gaming events and feel involved in gameplay, game worlds and game plots.<sup>15</sup> Although these sound effects play an important phenomenological role in ludology in general, I will additionally examine franchise literacy as another meaningful mode of immersion.

Among the many Easter eggs sprinkled throughout Hyrule, a more discreet variation lies in the soundtrack. Straddling nostalgia and novelty, the composers draw from earlier Zelda games to create new music. For example, riding a horse in the daytime prompts 'Riding (Day),' a track that features a violin's slow rendition of 'Zelda's Lullaby' upon galloping piano notes. Riding a horse at night would similarly trigger 'Riding (Night),' in which the violin echoes the first phrase of the iconic 'Overworld Theme' from *The Legend of Zelda* (1986). These melodic examples evoke the player's immersion within Hyrule, a world following a cohesive albeit complicated mythology. Additionally, horseback riding in *BOTW* specifically elicits memories of Epona, Link's trusty steed featured prominently in earlier games. Though musical Easter eggs only serve fans of the series, devotees regularly form the majority of the playership. In *BOTW*, familiarity evokes a sense of nostalgia as players return to Hyrule, where many series instalments unite under the same overarching timeline. At first, these covert soundbites welcome fans back to Hyrule via nostalgia and insider privilege. However, as the gameplay progresses and the player's relationship with the world evolves alongside the unfolding narrative, now-familiar music democratically reminds players, indiscriminate of franchise devotees and newbies, that they are once again in Hyrule whenever they load their saved file.

The ALI framework asserts that literacy relies on the player's familiarity with ludological elements to immerse players. However, not only does insider knowledge via franchisal familiarity create 'a more nuanced experience of the plot,'<sup>16</sup> it also supports that game sound should relate to previous instalments and associated films when

---

<sup>15</sup> Ibid.

<sup>16</sup> Stephanie Lind, "Active Interfaces and Thematic Events in *The Legend of Zelda: Ocarina of Time*," in *Music Video Games: Performance, Politics, and Play*, ed. Michael Austin (New York: Bloomsbury Academic, 2016), 83–105.

dealing with franchises or episodic content.<sup>17</sup> I thus propose to include franchisal familiarity within ludoliteracy as knowledge of a series, whether prior or recently acquired, is also an important agent in immersing players in the game world when approaching phenomenology.

### **Ready? FIGHT!**

As the adventure genre entails, the protagonist will face many foes along their journey. Since *BOTW* is not a role-playing game, players battle directly in the 'overworld' instead of entering a sequence distinct from the initial encounter. As video games have evolved into a rather agentic cinematic medium, van Elferen's framework fittingly deems 'interaction' the final dimension of analysis. 'Interaction' in ludomusicology includes many facets, whether choosing radio stations in *Grand Theft Auto* or 'griefer' harassment in *Lord of the Rings Online*. My analysis will not treat 'interaction' in these senses nor the traditional manner in which the game scores the player's performance, such as in *Dance Dance Revolution* and *Patapon*. Despite the strong musical tradition in the *Zelda* series, *BOTW* lacks performative elements, approaching sonic interactions differently. I will thus consider triggering unusual sound events and temporal distortion in combat as modes of interaction.

Game music demands interaction as sound depends on how players navigate the game and alter the game state. However, Stephanie Lind challenges this passivity, contending that in-game music is itself an event rather than a response to one.<sup>18</sup> I agree as though there are many sonic events in *BOTW* where Link is a mere observer, the optional quest 'Captured Memories' offers players opportunities to trigger, and thus interact with, unusual sound events. Briefly, the side quest has Link regaining lost memories by revisiting certain locations scattered throughout Hyrule. In this quest, a ludic phenomenology relies on musical interaction to lead to highly personal affective investments that hinge directly on memory and

---

<sup>17</sup> Karen Collins, *Game Sound* (Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press, 2008), 90.

<sup>18</sup> Lind, "Active Interfaces and Thematic Events in *The Legend of Zelda*," 86.

emotion.<sup>19</sup> As a non-linear quest revolving around musical interaction, each player's experience in finding the locations and learning of past events is bound to be unique.

In battle, one of the new mechanics introduced in *BOTW* is the 'Flurry Rush.' Dodging at exactly the right moment slows time, allowing Link a barrage of hits for a short moment before the regular tempo resumes. When time slows, the game acknowledges that the technique is in play by accordingly slowing down the battle music and accentuating the reverberations on each hit Link deals as part of his Flurry Rush. A plethora of other combat techniques in *BOTW* allow for sonic interaction of this nature, including the similar 'Perfect Shield' parry and 'Slow-Motion Archer,' where time slows midair to allow players to fire multiple arrows in rapid succession. To explain how this ludomusicological phenomenon immerses the player in the battle experience, I cite Michiel Kamp's allusion to Claudia Gorbman's 'anchorage' as a fundamental semiotic function of film music: game music 'often provides certainty about the nature of a situation to the player,'<sup>20</sup> which in this case is battle sounds acting as signals. This mode of musical interaction in *BOTW* requires players' full attention, completely engaging them in combat; 'Playing games, thus, quite simply, equals interacting with music'<sup>21</sup> as these distorted sounds grab the player's attention and anchor their experience within the fantasy world.

### **Press Any Button To Continue**

In this essay, I put van Elferen's ALI theory to the test by analysing sonic immersion in *BOTW*, an open world adventure game distinct from her ludomusical analyses of games in the survival and horror genres. First analysing musical/sonic affect, I found that ludomusicology currently lacks frameworks examining in-game environments as sound objects. Might this perhaps call for an 'eco-

---

<sup>19</sup> van Elferen, "Analysing Game Musical Immersion," 39.

<sup>20</sup> Michiel Kamp, "Suture and Peritexts: Music Beyond Gameplay and Diegesis," in *Ludomusicology: Approaches to Video Game Music*, ed. Michiel Kamp, Tim Summers, and Mark Sweeney (Sheffield: Equinox Publishing, 2016), 73-91.

<sup>21</sup> van Elferen, "Analysing Game Musical Immersion," 39.

ludomusicology'? I then highlighted the importance of including franchisal literacy when discussing ludoliteracy as knowledge of a video game series serves an important function in welcoming players back to—and (re)immersing them in—the fantasy world. I finished by discussing how non-linear narratives forge unique ludic experiences before delving into battle sound effects, examining how sonic distortion anchors players by seizing their full attention.

My analysis of *BOTW* expands the realm of ludomusicology as a discipline. As Cheng speculates if another type of ludomusicology is possible, I propose some new dimensions in which the field can level up. As the sequel to *BOTW* is still in development, may we return to Hyrule to continue our quest soon.

## Bibliography

- Cheng, William. "Toadofsky's Music Lessons." In *Music Video Games: Performance, Politics, and Play*, edited by Michael Austin, 297-303. New York: Bloomsbury Academic, 2016.
- Cheng, William. "Role-Playing toward a Virtual Musical Democracy in *The Lord of the Rings Online*." *Ethnomusicology* 56, no. 1 (2012): 83-105.
- Collins, Karen. *Game Sound*. Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press, 2008.
- Cook, Nicholas. *Analysing Musical Multimedia*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000.
- DeWinter, Jennifer. *Shigeru Miyamoto: Super Mario Bros., Donkey Kong, The Legend of Zelda*. New York: Bloomsbury Academic, 2015.
- Ermi, Laura, and Frans Mäyrä. "Fundamental Components of the Gameplay Experience: Analysing Immersion." In *DIGAREC Keynote-Lectures 2009/10*, edited by Stephan Günzel, Michael Liebe, and Dieter Mersch, 88-115. Potsdam: University Press, 2011.
- Hamel, Patrice. "Spatialités audiovisuelles." In *L'espace : Musique/Philosophie*, edited by HYPERLINK "https://www.editions-harmattan.fr/index.asp?navig=auteurs&obj=artiste&no=8049" \o "Lire la fiche de l'auteur" Jean-Marc Chouvel and HYPERLINK "https://www.editions-harmattan.fr/index.asp?navig=auteurs&obj=artiste&no=9011" \o "Lire la fiche de l'auteur" Makis Solomos, 331-339. Paris: L'Harmattan, 1998.
- Kamp, Michiel. "Suture and Peritexts: Music Beyond Gameplay and Diegesis." In *Ludomusicology: Approaches to Video Game Music*, edited by Michiel Kamp, Tim Summers, and Mark Sweeney, 73-91. Sheffield: Equinox Publishing, 2016.
- Kassabian, Anahid and Freya Jarman. "Game and Play in Music Video Games." In *Ludomusicology: Approaches to Video Game Music*, edited by Michiel Kamp, Tim Summers, and Mark Sweeney, 116-132. Sheffield: Equinox Publishing, 2016.
- Lach D. November 9, 2017 (5:39 a.m.). Comment on Game Maker's

- Toolkit, "The Music of Breath of the Wild | GMTK Extra," <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=3FWVKu1gnWs&lc=UgzndpAxUDL-PlqEdyJ4AaABAg>.
- Lind, Stephanie. "Active Interfaces and Thematic Events in *The Legend of Zelda: Ocarina of Time*." In *Music Video Games: Performance, Politics, and Play*, edited by Michael Austin, 83–105. New York: Bloomsbury Academic, 2016.
- Malm, William P. *Japanese Music and Musical Instruments*. Tokyo: C. E. Tuttle Co., 1959.
- Medina-Grey, Elizabeth. "Meaningful Modular Combinations: Simultaneous Harp and Environmental Music in Two *Legend of Zelda* Games." In *Music in Video Games: Studying Play*, edited by K. J. Donnelly, William Gibbons, and Neil Lerner, 104–21. New York: Routledge, 2014.
- Nacke, Lennart E., Sophie Stellmach, and Craig A. Linley, "Electroencephalographic Assessment of Player Experience: A Pilot Study in Affective Ludology." *Simulation & Gaming* 42, no. 5 (2010): 1–24.
- Otero, Jose. "The Legend of Zelda: Breath of the Wild Review," *IGN*. Last modified September 15, 2017. <https://www.ign.com/articles/2017/03/02/the-legend-of-zelda-breath-of-the-wild-review>.
- Rone, Vincent E. "History and Reception in the Music of *The Legend of Zelda* Peritexts." *Journal of Sound and Music in Games* 1, no. 2 (2020): 44–67.
- Stockburger, Axel. "The game environment from an auditive perspective." *AudioGames.net*, 2003, <https://audiogames.net/pics/upload/gameenvironment.htm>.
- Summers, Tim. "Analysing Video Game Music." In *Ludomusicology: Approaches to Video Game Music*, edited by Michiel Kamp, Tim Summers, and Mark Sweeney, 8–31. Sheffield: Equinox Publishing, 2016.
- Summers, Tim. *Understanding Video Game Music*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016.
- Sweeney, Mark. "Isaac's Silence: Purposive Aesthetics in *Dead Space*."

- In *Ludomusicology: Approaches to Video Game Music*, edited by Michiel Kamp, Tim Summers, and Mark Sweeney, 172–97. Sheffield: Equinox Publishing, 2016.
- van Elferen, Isabella. "Analysing Game Musical Immersion: The ALI Model." In *Ludomusicology: Approaches to Video Game Music*, edited by Michiel Kamp, Tim Summers, and Mark Sweeney, 32–52. Sheffield: Equinox Publishing, 2016.
- van Elferen, Isabella. "¡Un Forastero! Issues of Virtuality and Diegesis in Videogame Music." *Music and the Moving Image* 4, no. 2 (2011): 30-39.
- Webster, Andrew. "The Legend of Zelda: Breath of the Wild Review." *The Verge*, March 2, 2017, <https://www.theverge.com/2017/3/2/14787082/the-legend-of-zelda-breath-of-the-wild-review>.





### 3

## **Cultural Policy, Charity Organisations and the Social Integration of Refugees Through Music**

### *A Case Study of Catching Cultures Orchestra and Orchestre Partout*

*Marthe Holman*

#### **Abstract**

The last couple of decades saw an increase of charity organisations in the Netherlands and across the world that organise music projects for refugees, asylum seekers, and status holders. A number of these organisations are music ensembles, such as Utrecht-based Catching Cultures Orchestra (CCO) and Amsterdam-based Orchestre Partout (OP). The goals of these organisations include connecting members of the "host" society and "newcomers" through music making to benefit social integration.

Recent scholarship mostly focusses on single organisations, such as El Sistema and the West-Eastern Divan Orchestra. Yet, the global increase of charity organisations using arts and music to affect social change and the cultural policies and funding systems that relate to these organisations show that social and economic impacts of culture, including integration, are high on the agenda of multiple actors. In this paper, by drawing on Yúdice's theory on the "expediency of culture," I analyse the constellations of (neo-)liberal actors and funding systems around CCO and OP in the Netherlands. I focus on the specific aim of the organisations and government actors to benefit social integration and research the intersections between Dutch and European cultural- and asylum policies (Martiniello 2015). I show how the instrumentalisation of music aimed at facilitating social integration is embedded in (inter)national- and municipal cultural policies, government funding bodies, and in (mission) statements of CCO and OP.

### **Biography**

After finishing the Bachelor of Musicology at Utrecht University in 2017, **Marthe Holman** graduated from the Research Master Musicology at Utrecht University in August 2019. Holman’s RMA thesis researched charity organisations that organise music projects for refugees in relation to global trends in the “instrumentalisation” of culture. Throughout her bachelors and RMA, Holman pursued researching the role of music in violent conflict and peacebuilding. Additionally, electives in gender studies, postcolonialism, and memory studies influenced and continue to influence my thinking. At the moment, Holman considers applying for a PhD or pursuing a career in (cultural) policy and international relations.

**Keywords:** charity organisations, cultural policy, instrumentalisation of music, refugees, social integration

**Affiliation:** Postgraduate from Utrecht University, Utrecht, the Netherlands

**Email address:** martheholman@gmail.com

## Introduction

In response to the so-called “refugee-crisis” of 2015, an increasing number of non-profit organisations established music and art projects focusing on “newcomers,” “refugees,” “asylum seekers,” “status holders,” and “migrants in the Netherlands.”<sup>1</sup> De Vrolijkheid, for example, is a longer-standing organisation that organises music and art projects for children, and occasionally their parents, residing at asylum seeker centres across the Netherlands.<sup>2</sup> There were also newly established organisations and those that solidified into formal ones, such as Orchestre Partout (OP) and Catching Cultures Orchestra (CCO). All these organisations, however, do not stand on their own or solely in response to the “refugee crisis” but, I argue, are part of the global phenomenon of the “instrumentalisation of culture.” The instrumentalisation of culture is a global trend in which arts and culture are used as a means to other ends or as a “resource” by governments and organisations alike. The envisioned (social) impacts include economic and social developments like social cohesion, integration, and neighbourhood development.

In this paper, I analyse how the aim to socially integrate refugees and migrants figures in cultural policy programs and in the mission statements of Dutch organisations, taking OP and CCO as case studies. I situate the connections made between music making and integration in the larger phenomenon of the expediency and

---

<sup>1</sup> The labels “refugee,” “asylum seeker,” “status holder,” and “(forced) migrant” are identity categories that are politically and socially charged and have shifting (legal) definitions with important implications for people that are ascribed these identity markers. In this paper, I have chosen to stay as close as possible to the Dutch legal definitions of these labels, which nonetheless are politically charged and informed. See for critique on the denotation “refugee,” or “migrant crisis,” Heaven Crawley and Dimitris Skleparis, “Refugees, Migrants, Neither, Both: Categorical Fetishism and the Politics of Bounding in Europe’s Migration Crisis,” *Journal of Ethical and Migration Studies* 44/1 (2018): 48-64., Miriam Ticktin, “Thinking Beyond Humanitarian Borders,” *Social Research* 83/2 (2016): 255-271., Roger Zetter, “More Labels, Fewer Refugees: Remaking the Refugee Label in an Era of Globalization,” *Journal of Refugee Studies* 20/2 (2007): 172-192.

<sup>2</sup> See De Vrolijkheid, “Home,” <https://vrolijkheid.nl> (accessed August 24, 2020).

instrumentalisation of culture by drawing on the work of George Yúdice, Kees Vuyk, and Eleonora Belfiore and Oliver Bennet.

Below, I will first examine the kinds of organisations that organise music activities for refugees, as well as the establishment and the missions of CCO and OP. After that, I discuss the instrumentalisation of culture and provide an assessment of how CCO and OP and the cultural policy funding that applies to these organisations can be understood from this framework. Finally, I show how CCO and OP’s mission statements and funding mechanisms relate to cultural- and asylum policies. Here, I draw on recent research of Paul DiMaggio, Patricia Fernández-Kelly, and Marco Martiniello. The three examples in this final part of the paper offer insight into the relation between Dutch and European cultural- and asylum policies, the mission statements of CCO and OP, and the instrumentalisation of culture.

### **The Establishment and Mission of OP and CCO**

There are numerous terms in use today that describe organisations that fall somewhere in between (official) government organisations and organisations aimed at profit, including non-government organisations (NGOs), charity organisations, non- (or not-) for-profit organisations, and civil society organisations (CSOs). This sector, also called “the third sector,” consists of organisations that in wide-ranging ways seek to better social, economic, environmental, or political circumstances, ideally without having profit motives.<sup>3</sup> In the Netherlands, many—if not all—of the organisations that organise music projects for refugees legally fall under the category of “charity” or good-cause organisations on the basis of their cultural ANBI legal status.<sup>4</sup> Since charity organisations may nonetheless be (in)directly

---

<sup>3</sup> David Lewis and Nazneen Kanji, *Non-governmental Organizations and Development*, 1<sup>st</sup> ed. (London and New York: Routledge, 2009), 7-8.

<sup>4</sup> Short for Public Benefit Organisation (*Algemeen Nut Beoogende Instelling*), these organisations are obliged to make sure that ninety percent of their efforts and activities are in support of the common good and are organised without profit motives. Cultural ANBI organisations receive additional tax benefits. See: Belastingdienst, “Wat is een ANBI,”

financially supported by government institutions and bodies, it is often difficult to draw a distinctive line between for-profit, government, and non-government organisations. As will become clear later in this paper, CCO and OP are likewise (in)directly funded by European and Dutch government funding bodies and municipalities.

OP grew out of the initiative of Ted van Leeuwen to give music lessons in the asylum seeker centre (AZC) in Alkmaar in the Netherlands in 2010. Six years later, in 2016, OP became an independent organisation. Its activities are twofold and consist of rehearsals and performances of the band *Orchestre Partout* and the weekly organised music lessons and band rehearsals at the AZCs in Amsterdam, Dronten, and Heerhugowaard. At the end of 2019, the additional performing band *Les Super Étoiles de Partout* was established and OP started organising festivals under the name of *Mundo Sonora* in the cities and villages where the AZCs are located.<sup>5</sup>

CCO initially started out as a temporary collaboration between the Utrecht based brass band *De Tegenwind* (conducted by Hermine Schneider, who has been conducting CCO since its foundation), and the *Band zonder Verblijfsvergunning* (*Band without Residency Permit*, BzV).<sup>6</sup> BzV was founded after the example of OP with the financial support of *De Vrolijkheid*, and OP on its turn was also established

---

[https://www.belastingdienst.nl/wps/wcm/connect/bldcontentnl/belastingdienst/zakelijk/bijzondere\\_regelingen/goede\\_doelen/algemeen\\_nut\\_beogende\\_instellingen/wat\\_is\\_een\\_anbi](https://www.belastingdienst.nl/wps/wcm/connect/bldcontentnl/belastingdienst/zakelijk/bijzondere_regelingen/goede_doelen/algemeen_nut_beogende_instellingen/wat_is_een_anbi) (accessed August 16, 2020)., Belastingdienst, "Aan welke voorwaarden moet een ANBI voldoen?"

[https://www.belastingdienst.nl/wps/wcm/connect/bldcontentnl/belastingdienst/zakelijk/bijzondere\\_regelingen/goede\\_doelen/algemeen\\_nut\\_beogende\\_instellingen/aan\\_welke\\_voorwaarden\\_moet\\_een\\_anbi\\_voldoen/](https://www.belastingdienst.nl/wps/wcm/connect/bldcontentnl/belastingdienst/zakelijk/bijzondere_regelingen/goede_doelen/algemeen_nut_beogende_instellingen/aan_welke_voorwaarden_moet_een_anbi_voldoen/) (accessed August 16, 2020).

<sup>5</sup> See *Orchestre Partout*, "Les Super Étoiles de Partout,"

<https://orchestrepartout.nl/les-super-etoiles-de-partout/> (accessed August 17, 2020).

<sup>6</sup> Additional to the funding of *De Vrolijkheid*, BzV was established through a crowdfunding project on the platform of *Voordekunst* in 2013. *De Vrolijkheid, Vrolijkheid zit in de Gekste Dingen: Annual Year Report De Vrolijkheid 2013* (Amsterdam: *De Vrolijkheid*, 2013), 35. Available through [https://vrolijkheid.nl/site/assets/files/1368/vrolijkheid\\_jaarverslag\\_2013.pdf](https://vrolijkheid.nl/site/assets/files/1368/vrolijkheid_jaarverslag_2013.pdf) (accessed August 23, 2020).

through funding of De Vrolijkheid. In 2017, CCO became an independent organisation.<sup>7</sup>

In regards to target group and constituency, musical choices, repertoire, and missions, OP and CCO are very similar. Both organisations focus on connecting musicians and people labelled as “refugee” or “status holder” with “host” audiences and musicians. They consist of a (core) group that performs regularly and involves musicians with a refugee background and musicians born in the Netherlands. Both chose to rehearse and perform music that the participants with a refugee background propose, and as a result, make use of divergent instrumentalisation and (multi-linguistic) repertoire.<sup>8</sup>

For the purpose of this paper, the commonalities regarding the visions and missions of OP and CCO is most important, although these differ slightly with respect to their emphasis on having a social impact. The two pillars driving the activities of CCO are musical curiosity and social concern.<sup>9</sup> According to a statement on their website, they want to:

“[...] offer a stage for the talents and individuality of people who fled to the Netherlands; offer people with different backgrounds the opportunity to experience each other’s music, inspire each other and get involved into each other’s lives. We want to have a musical contribution to tackling the problems that newcomers have when they want to integrate in the Netherlands.”<sup>10</sup>

---

<sup>7</sup> Catching Cultures Orchestra, “Hoe het begon,” last modified: 2020, <https://catchingculturesorchestra.nl/over-ons/hoe-het-begon/> (accessed August 23, 2020).

<sup>8</sup> See for music examples and sheet music, Orchestre Partout, “Music,” <https://orchestrepourt.nl/music/> (accessed August 25, 2020).

<sup>9</sup> Catching Cultures Orchestra, “Over Ons,” <https://catchingculturesorchestra.nl/over-ons/> (accessed August 24, 2020).

<sup>10</sup> Freely translated from Dutch by the author, Catching Cultures Orchestra, “Over Ons,” <https://catchingculturesorchestra.nl/over-ons/> (accessed August 24, 2020).

To accomplish the above-mentioned mission, CCO formulates (side-)goals for their participants. These goals consist of learning Dutch, building a (neighbourhood) community and a (professional) network, develop talents, and breaking through social isolation and the daily life routine of AZCs, all of which are ultimately seen to benefit the social integration of the people with a refugee background.<sup>11</sup>

In comparison with CCO, OP seems more focused on the intrinsic values of music making and on musical curiosity. In the interview I held with him, Van Leeuwen stated that he is sceptical about facilitating integration through music making and that his main drive behind OP is his musical curiosity. His main goal with OP is to offer a stage to the music that the residents of the AZC bring with them, and through their performances contradict the portrayal of refugees as mostly “victims.”<sup>12</sup>

The efforts of charity organisations to use music and art as a means to affect social change and the interest of governments to invest in the work of these organisations can be understood through the framework and global trend of the instrumentalisation of culture, which I will discuss below.

### **The Expediency and Instrumentalisation of Culture**

The arts and music are increasingly used by governments and non-government actors as a means to reach other ends and affect (social) change in areas such as conflict transformation, social cohesion and integration, and economic development (including attracting tourism and settlement of companies).<sup>13</sup> Especially during the last two decades, budget cuts in cultural policy funding the Netherlands and elsewhere in Europe gave rise to societal and political debates about the value of

---

<sup>11</sup> Catching Cultures Orchestra, “Over Ons.”

<sup>12</sup> Ted van Leeuwen, interview with author held on May 6, 2019, Amsterdam AZC.

<sup>13</sup> George Yúdice, *The Expediency of Culture: Uses of Culture in the Global Era* (Durham; London: Duke University Press, 2003), 11; Kees Vuyk, “The Arts as an Instrument? Notes on the Controversy Surrounding the Value of Art,” *International Journal of Cultural Policies* 16/2 (2010): 173.

arts and culture.<sup>14</sup> Within these debates in the Netherlands, two strands of arguments can be recognised: those arguments that underline the intrinsic value of art, and arguments that highlight the “instrumental” benefits of art and culture. As of late, the arguments of these two strands are increasingly used alongside one another. Likewise, the two-fold reasoning of CCO and OP in terms of musical curiosity and social concern discussed above reflect both instrumental and intrinsic values of music.

The trend to use arts and culture instrumentally is explored by, among others, George Yúdice and Kees Vuyk. Yúdice views the use of arts and culture as a means to other ends (i.e. the instrumentalisation of culture) as part of the “expediency of culture.” He argues that after the Cold War, the legitimisation of art and cultural policy took a different shape, partly because of globalisation which accelerated the process in which everything is seen as a resource, and partly because of the fall of communism.<sup>15</sup> The fall of communism meant that Western governments no longer deemed it necessary to ideologically situate against the utilitarianism of art in communist societies by highlighting the autonomy of art and artistic freedom. Vuyk additionally points out how the end of the Cold War influenced current debates about cultural participation as a form of democratic cultural policy and the propagandisation of the freedom and autonomy of the arts against the utilitarianism of the Soviet Union, respectively reflecting arguments in favour of instrumentalisation and the intrinsic value of art.<sup>16</sup>

---

<sup>14</sup> Eleonora Belfiore and Oliver Bennet, *The Social Impacts of the Arts: An Intellectual History* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008), 10., Vuyk, “The Arts as an Instrument?” 173-183.

<sup>15</sup> Yúdice, *The Expediency of Culture*, 11. However, Rachel Beckles Willson argues that long before the Cold War, Protestant missions bringing Western (classical) music to Palestine to “civilise” people precede current projects like the West-Eastern Divan Orchestra which aims to connect Palestinian and Israeli youths. See Rachel Beckles Willson, *Orientalism and Musical Mission: Palestine and the West* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013)., Rachel Beckles Willson, “The Parallax Worlds of the West-Eastern Divan Orchestra,” *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 134/2 (2009): 319-347.

<sup>16</sup> Vuyk, “The Arts as an Instrument?” 176.



However, Yúdice goes further and, by building on Foucault, proposes to see the rise of postmodernism, including the expediency of culture, as a fourth episteme.<sup>17</sup> In this fourth episteme, “the different (neo-)liberal constellations of networks between governments, non-government organisations, civil society, and other institutions such as the judiciary, the police, and educational systems result in different struggles over culture as a resource.”<sup>18</sup> According to Yúdice, drawing on Elcior Santana’s work, this (neo-)liberal system also means that funders of arts and culture and the different actors mentioned by Yúdice rely on mechanisms of expectations of a return and compensation when using culture as a resource for other ends.<sup>19</sup> These returns and compensations include economic development and social development in areas such as education, health, social integration and cohesion, and neighbourhood development. Below, I go into the (neo-)liberal constellations of European and Dutch actors, including CCO, OP, cultural funding bodies and government organisations more deeply, and demonstrate through three examples how the instrumentalisation of culture figures in these constellations.

### **Music Organisations, Funding, and Social Integration**

In this part of the paper, I go into three examples that show how CCO and OP interact with and are situated in cultural policy environments that are invested in achieving social integration by using the arts instrumentally. In order to do so, it is important to unravel how the musical organisations are funded and which cultural policy environments they interact with. DiMaggio and Fernández-Kelly argue that “creative behaviour is not a random occurrence driven solely by personal desires; individuals act in environments shaped by

---

<sup>17</sup> Yúdice, *The Expediency of Culture*, 28-30.

<sup>18</sup> Marthe Holman, “Connecting Refugees Through Music: Charity Organisations and the Instrumentalisation of Culture” (master thesis, Utrecht University, 2019), 64.

<sup>19</sup> Yúdice, *The Expediency of Culture*, 14-15. Yúdice refers to Elcior Santana, Remarks at “Transnationalization of Support for Culture in a Globalizing World” (Bellagio Study and Conference Center, Villa Serbelloni, Bellagio, Italy, 6-10 December, 1999).

legislative and policy measures.”<sup>20</sup> In addition to this, I argue that not only individuals but also organisations and institutions act in certain legislative and policy environments, which influences their behaviour. Furthermore, I argue that all these actors, as well as the legislative and policy environments they are embedded in, draw from the instrumentalisation of culture. This becomes clear when looking at the intersections between cultural policy and asylum and integration policy more closely, and at how art is or could be used in policies for incorporation and social cohesion, as Martiniello suggests.<sup>21</sup>

In the Netherlands, like in many other European countries, cultural projects and institutions are funded through a mixture of private donors, national, and municipality funding, and (profit) income of the market. Moreover, selected projects, organisations and institutions are financed through European Union cultural funding. The first example shows how cultural policy and asylum policies interact on a European level and intervene in arts and culture by funding music organisations. De Vrolijkheid as mentioned above, (financially) helped establish OP and BzV; the predecessor of CCO. De Vrolijkheid itself received funding from the Asylum, Migration and Integration Fund (AMIF) between 2014-2020, a fund from the European Commission’s Directorate General for Migration and Home Affairs.<sup>22</sup> The AMIF aims to support “national efforts to improve reception capacities, ensure that asylum procedures are in line with Union Standards, integrate migrants at local and regional levels and

---

<sup>20</sup> Paul DiMaggio and Patricia Fernández-Kelly, “Immigration and the Arts: A Theoretical Inquiry,” *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 38/8 (2015): 1236-1237.

<sup>21</sup> Marco Martiniello, “Immigrants, Ethnicized Minorities and the Arts: A Relatively Neglected Research Area,” *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 38/8 (2015): 1232-1233.

<sup>22</sup> De Vrolijkheid for example, received 1.284.824 million euros; the total amount of AMIF spread over 7 years is 3.137 billion euros, see Ministerie van Sociale Zaken en Werkgelegenheid, “Verleende en Vastgestelde Projecten AMIF/ISF/SA,” published June 25, 2020, <https://www.uitvoeringvanbeleidszw.nl/subsidies-en-regelingen/asiel-migratie-en-integratiefonds-amif/documenten/publicaties/2020/06/25/verleende-en-vastgestelde-projecten-amif-isf-sa> (accessed August 25, 2020).

increase the effectiveness of return programmes.”<sup>23</sup> Thus, the EU’s investments in cultural projects like those of De Vrolijkheid are based on the promotion of an expected return: “the effective *integration* of non-EU nationals.”<sup>24</sup>

The second example shows how the Dutch government intervenes in arts and culture and aims for social integration by (in)directly funding music and arts organisations, often along the policy lines of cultural participation, diversity, and cultural education. In the Netherlands, national cultural policy funding is arranged by the Ministry of Education, Culture, and Science (*Ministerie van Onderwijs, Kunst, en Cultuur*, OCW). The institutional funding—which is decided on every four years—is distributed through the so-called basic infrastructure (*basis infrastructuur*, BIS). Through the BIS, a number of cultural institutions are directly funded by the Ministry of OCW, but it also consists of six funding organisations (*Rijkscultuurfondsen*) that further distribute funding. One of these is the Cultural Participation Fund (CPF) which is responsible for providing opportunities for cultural participation and education.<sup>25</sup> The CPF, for example, funded and awarded OP in 2011 with the for the first time awarded Golden C price (*Gouden C*) for their impact, innovation, and inspiration, and is currently funding OP’s Mundo Sonora Project, as well as CCO’s project Make Room for Music of Newcomers (*Maak Ruimte voor Muziek van Nieuwkomers*).<sup>26</sup> In a similar fashion, the municipalities of Utrecht

---

<sup>23</sup> European Commission, “EU Funding for Migration and Security: How it Works,” [https://ec.europa.eu/home-affairs/e-library/multimedia/publications/eu-funding-for-migration-and-security-how-it-works\\_en](https://ec.europa.eu/home-affairs/e-library/multimedia/publications/eu-funding-for-migration-and-security-how-it-works_en) (accessed August 25, 2020).

<sup>24</sup> Original emphasis. Directorate General for Migration and Home Affairs, *Snapshots from EU Asylum, Migration and Integration Fund and EU Internal Security Fund* (2017), 9. Available through: [https://ec.europa.eu/home-affairs/sites/homeaffairs/files/20175691\\_dr0217970enn.pdf](https://ec.europa.eu/home-affairs/sites/homeaffairs/files/20175691_dr0217970enn.pdf) (accessed August 25, 2020).

<sup>25</sup> Ministerie van Onderwijs, Cultuur, en Wetenschap, Cultuursubsidie, “Rijkscultuurfondsen,” <https://www.cultuursubsidie.nl/over-het-cultuurstelsel/rijkscultuurfondsen> (accessed August 21, 2020).

<sup>26</sup> Fonds voor Cultuurparticipatie, “Maak Ruimte voor Muziek van Nieuwkomers,” <https://cultuurparticipatie.nl/projecten/82/maakruimte-voor-muziek-van-nieuwkomers> (accessed August 26, 2020)., Fonds voor Cultuurparticipatie, “Mundo Sonora,” <https://cultuurparticipatie.nl/projecten/99/mundo-sonora> (accessed August

and Amsterdam have funded the efforts of CCO and OP under the banners of cultural participation, diversity and neighbourhood development.

Finally, the expectations of returns, according to Yúdice and Belfiore & Bennet, help explain the increased popularity of conducting evidence-based policymaking and evidence-based research into the actual impacts of the arts.<sup>27</sup> In the Netherlands for example, the OCW issued the National Centre of Expertise for Cultural Education and Amateur Arts (*Landelijk Kennisinstituut Cultuureducatie en Amateurkunst*, LKCA) in 2017 to research how art projects targeting status holders aid integration in the Netherlands, which elements work and which do not, and make up an inventory of organisations. The LKCA is part of the BIS and as such receives structural, cultural funding from the OCW. CCO and OP, among other music organisations, appear in the report of LKCA’s research. The “working elements” LKCA describes include learning the Dutch language and getting to know Dutch society, finding a job, share each other’s culture,<sup>28</sup> and building a network.<sup>29</sup> As has been shown above, these working elements are similar to those mentioned by CCO in its mission statements. On the basis of this research, the LKCA further encourages like-minded art projects aimed at refugees and status holders to facilitate their social integration.

---

26, 2020)., Fonds voor Cultuurparticipatie, “Gouden C Winnaars,” <https://cultuurparticipatie.nl/gouden-c-winnaars> (accessed August 26, 2020).

<sup>27</sup> Belfiore and Bennet, *The Social Impact of the Arts*, 5-12.

<sup>28</sup> Angela van Dijk, Saskia van Grinsven, Nada de Grot, Joost de Haan, and Maaïke Kluft, *Culturele Interventies Gericht op Statushouders: Een Verkenning naar Werkzame Elementen* (LKCA and Movisie, January 2019). Available through: [https://www.lkca.nl/wp-content/uploads/2020/01/culturele\\_interventies\\_gericht\\_op\\_volwassen\\_statushouder\\_s\\_lkca\\_movisie\\_kis.pdf](https://www.lkca.nl/wp-content/uploads/2020/01/culturele_interventies_gericht_op_volwassen_statushouder_s_lkca_movisie_kis.pdf) (accessed August 25, 2020).

<sup>29</sup> LKCA, “Cultuur en Nieuwkomers,” “Werkzame elementen van Kunst en Cultuur,” <https://www.lkca.nl/artikel/cultuur-en-nieuwkomers/#werkzameelementennieuwkomers> (accessed August 27, 2020).

## Conclusion

In this paper, I explored the intersection between cultural- and asylum policy by looking at the AMIF funding of De Vrolijkheid (which financially helped found CCO and OP), the funding of OP by the CPF, and LKCA's evidence-based policy research issued by the Dutch government into art organisations and how they aid integration. These examples show how multiple actors in (neo-)liberal constellations are situated in policy and legal environments in which art is seen as a resource. Through the musical activities that CCO and OP organise, they hope to connect people from diverse (musical) backgrounds and, CCO more so than OP, ultimately hope to benefit social integration of refugees.

Since the number of organisations with similar aims only seems to increase, critical research becomes more important. Whether and to what extent music making can achieve social integration and other social and economic goals is a question that remains hanging. But what has been made clear is that many (neo-)liberal actors—charity organisations, government bodies, funding bodies, and also art consumers—as well as legislative and policy environments seem to believe, interact and work with the idea(l) that music can have life-transforming social impacts.

## Bibliography

### Interviews

Roelof Wittink. General director and sousaphone player of Catching Cultures Orchestra. Interview held with author on May 23, 2019, in Utrecht, TivoliVredenburg.

Ted van Leeuwen. Founder and music leader of Orchestre Partout. Interview with author held on May 6, 2019, Amsterdam, Asylum Seeker Centrum Amsterdam.

### Secondary literature

Baker, Geoffrey. *El Sistema: Orchestrating Venezuela's Youth*. London and New York: Oxford University Press, 2014.

Beckles Willson, Rachel. *Orientalism and Musical Mission: Palestine and the West*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013.

\_\_\_\_\_. "The Parallax Worlds of the West-Eastern Divan Orchestra." *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 134/2 (2009): 319-347.

Belfiore, Eleonora., and Oliver Bennet. *The Social Impacts of the Arts: An Intellectual History*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008.

Crawley, Heaven, and Dimitris Skleparis. "Refugees, Migrants, Neither, Both: Categorical Fetishism and the Politics of Bounding in Europe's 'Migration Crisis.'" *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 44/1 (2018): 48-64.

DiMaggio, Paul, and Patricia Fernández-Kelly. "Immigration and the Arts: A Theoretical Inquiry." *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 38/8 (2015): 1236-1244.

\_\_\_\_\_. "Introduction: The Diversity and Mobility of Immigrant Arts." In *Art in the Lives of Immigrant Communities in the United States*, edited by Paul DiMaggio and Patricia Fernández-Kelly, 1-22. New Brunswick N.J: Rutgers University Press, 2010.

Holman, Marthe. "Connecting Refugees Through Music: Charity Organisations and the Instrumentalisation of Culture." Master thesis, Utrecht University, 2019.

Lewis, David., and Nazneen Kanji. *Non-governmental Organizations*

- and Development*, 1<sup>st</sup> edition. London and New York: Routledge, 2009.
- Martiniello, Marco. "Immigrants, Ethnicized Minorities and the Arts: A Relatively Neglected Research Area." *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 38/8 (2015): 1229-1235.
- Santana, Elcior. Remarks at "Transnationalization of Support for Culture in a Globalizing World." Bellagio Study and Conference Center, Villa Serbelloni, Bellagio, Italy, 6-10 December, 1999.
- Ticktin, Miriam. "Thinking Beyond Humanitarian Borders." *Social Research* 83/2 (2016): 255-271.
- Vuyk, Kees. "The Arts as an Instrument? Notes on the Controversy Surrounding the Value of Art." *International Journal of Cultural Policy* 16/2 (2010): 173-183.
- Yúdice, George. *The Expediency of Culture: Uses of Culture in the Global Era*. Durham and London: Duke University Press, 2003.
- Zetter, Roger. "More Labels, Fewer Refugees: Remaking the Refugee Label in an Era of Globalization." *Journal of Refugee Studies* 20/2 (2007): 172-192.
- Annual Reports, Policy Reports, and Art Council Reports and Policy Advices De Vrolijkheid. *Vrolijkheid zit in de Gekste Dingen: Annual Year Report De Vrolijkheid 2013*. Amsterdam: De Vrolijkheid, 2013. Available through: [https://vrolijkheid.nl/site/assets/files/1368/vrolijkheid\\_jaarverslag\\_2013.pdf](https://vrolijkheid.nl/site/assets/files/1368/vrolijkheid_jaarverslag_2013.pdf). Accessed August 23, 2020.
- Directorate General for Migration and Home Affairs. *Snapshots from EU Asylum, Migration and Integration Fund and EU Internal Security Fund* (2017). Available through: [https://ec.europa.eu/home-affairs/sites/homeaffairs/files/20175691\\_dr0217970enn.pdf](https://ec.europa.eu/home-affairs/sites/homeaffairs/files/20175691_dr0217970enn.pdf). Accessed August 25, 2020.
- Van Dijk, Angela., Saskia van Grinsven, Nada de Grot, Joost de Haan, and Maaike Kluft. *Culturele Interventies Gericht op Statushouders: Een Verkenning naar Werkzame Elementen*. LKCA and Movisie, January 2019. Available through:

[https://www.lkca.nl/wp-content/uploads/2020/01/culturele\\_interventies\\_gericht\\_op\\_voelwassen\\_statushouders\\_lkca\\_movisie\\_kis.pdf](https://www.lkca.nl/wp-content/uploads/2020/01/culturele_interventies_gericht_op_voelwassen_statushouders_lkca_movisie_kis.pdf). Accessed August 25, 2020.

### **Internet resources**

Belastingdienst. “Aan welke voorwaarden moet een ANBI voldoen?” [https://www.belastingdienst.nl/wps/wcm/connect/bldcontentnl/belastingdienst/zakelijk/bijzondere\\_regelingen/goede\\_doelen/algemeen\\_nut\\_beogende\\_instellingen/aan\\_welke\\_voorwaarden\\_moet\\_een\\_anbi\\_voldoen/](https://www.belastingdienst.nl/wps/wcm/connect/bldcontentnl/belastingdienst/zakelijk/bijzondere_regelingen/goede_doelen/algemeen_nut_beogende_instellingen/aan_welke_voorwaarden_moet_een_anbi_voldoen/). Accessed August 16, 2020.

Belastingdienst. “Culturele ANBI.” [https://www.belastingdienst.nl/wps/wcm/connect/bldcontentnl/belastingdienst/zakelijk/bijzondere\\_regelingen/goede\\_doelen/algemeen\\_nut\\_beogende\\_instellingen/culturele\\_anbi/culturele\\_anbi](https://www.belastingdienst.nl/wps/wcm/connect/bldcontentnl/belastingdienst/zakelijk/bijzondere_regelingen/goede_doelen/algemeen_nut_beogende_instellingen/culturele_anbi/culturele_anbi). Accessed August 16, 2020.

Belastingdienst. “Wat is een ANBI.” [https://www.belastingdienst.nl/wps/wcm/connect/bldcontentnl/belastingdienst/zakelijk/bijzondere\\_regelingen/goede\\_doelen/algemeen\\_nut\\_beogende\\_instellingen/wat\\_is\\_een\\_anbi](https://www.belastingdienst.nl/wps/wcm/connect/bldcontentnl/belastingdienst/zakelijk/bijzondere_regelingen/goede_doelen/algemeen_nut_beogende_instellingen/wat_is_een_anbi). Accessed August 16, 2020.

Catching Cultures Orchestra. “Over Ons.” <https://catchingculturesorchestra.nl/over-ons/>. Accessed August 24, 2020.

De Vrolijkheid. “Home.” <https://vrolijkheid.nl>. Accessed August 24, 2020.

European Commission. “EU Funding for Migration and Security: How it Works.” [https://ec.europa.eu/home-affairs/e-library/multimedia/publications/eu-funding-for-migration-and-security-how-it-works\\_en](https://ec.europa.eu/home-affairs/e-library/multimedia/publications/eu-funding-for-migration-and-security-how-it-works_en). Accessed August 25, 2020.

Fonds voor Cultuurparticipatie. “Gouden C Winnaars.” <https://cultuurparticipatie.nl/gouden-c-winnaars>. Accessed August 26, 2020.

Fonds voor Cultuurparticipatie. “Maak Ruimte voor Muziek van



- Nieuwkomers.”  
<https://cultuurparticipatie.nl/projecten/82/maakruimte-voor-muziek-van-nieuwkomers>. Accessed August 26, 2020.
- Fonds voor Cultuurparticipatie. “Mundo Sonora.”  
<https://cultuurparticipatie.nl/projecten/99/mundo-sonora>.  
Accessed August 26, 2020.
- LKCA. “Cultuur en Nieuwkomers,” “Werkzame elementen van Kunst en Cultuur.” <https://www.lkca.nl/artikel/cultuur-en-nieuwkomers/#werkzameelementennieuwkomers>. Accessed August 27, 2020.
- Ministerie van Onderwijs, Cultuur, en Wetenschap, Cultuursubsidie. “Rijkscultuurfondsen.” <https://www.cultuursubsidie.nl/over-het-cultuurstelsel/rijkscultuurfondsen>. Accessed August 21, 2020).
- Ministerie van Sociale Zaken en Werkgelegenheid, “Verleende en Vastgestelde Projecten AMIF/ISF/SA.” Published June 25, 2020. <https://www.uitvoeringvanbeleidszw.nl/subsidies-en-regelingen/asiel-migratie-en-integratiefonds-amif/documenten/publicaties/2020/06/25/verleende-en-vastgestelde-projecten-amif-isf-sa>. Accessed August 25, 2020.
- Orchestre Partout. “Les Super Étoiles de Partout.”  
<https://orchestrepartout.nl/les-super-etoiles-de-partout/>.  
Accessed August 17, 2020.
- Orchestre Partout. “Music.” <https://orchestrepartout.nl/music/>.  
Accessed August 25, 2020.



## **Soviet Remnants in a Post-Soviet World**

### *More Thoughts on the History and Historiography of Russian Music*

*Céleste Pagniello*

#### **Abstract**

In 1984, Richard Taruskin published an article titled ‘Some Thoughts on the History and Historiography of Russian Music,’ chronicling the state of Russian music scholarship during the late years of the Soviet Union and the political shifts that led to the discipline’s then-present position. Now, nearly four decades later, Taruskin’s thoughts prove to be more pertinent than ever, as Russia’s relationship with the West crumbles once more, threatening to put an end to growing collaboration in all aspects of research. While politics and art have long been inseparable, this relationship has irrevocably shaped the region’s musical canon and subsequently its musicological output and the field’s historiography. Today’s musicologist faces the challenge of separating facts from propaganda, as well as building new narratives free from the political ideology of the Soviet years. Freeing the past from Soviet ideology, however, comes with the new challenge of reconciling it with present-day Russia’s values, still often significantly different than those of the West. This paper will examine the new developments in Russian music historiography since Taruskin’s paper, as well as the results of the treatment of music historiography under the Soviets. It will discuss Cold War mentalities and their remnants, while looking for avenues for future collaboration, despite growing political unrest between Russia and the West.

### **Biography**

Canadian **Céleste Pagniello** holds a Bachelor of Music degree from McGill University (2018) and a Master of Philosophy degree from the University of Cambridge (2020), where her research focused on Boris Asafyev and *The Fountain of Bakhchisarai* ballet. She has spent time studying in Saint Petersburg, Russia, and Minsk, Belarus, and is currently undertaking a second Master of Philosophy degree at the University of Cambridge, with a focus on Soviet Belarusian literature. Her research interests include everything Tchaikovsky, Russian and Soviet ballet, and the relationship between literature and music.

**Keywords:** Historiography, Russia, Soviet Union, censorship, propaganda

**Affiliation:** University of Cambridge, Cambridge, United Kingdom

**Email address:** cp688@cam.ac.uk

‘There is no area of music historiography that is in greater need of fundamental revision than that of Russian music [...]’  
– Richard Taruskin<sup>1</sup>

Richard Taruskin’s 1984 article ‘Some Thoughts on the History and Historiography of Russian Music,’ chronicling the state of Russian music scholarship during the late years of the Soviet Union, portrayed a field torn in two by political differences. A lack of accessibility to sources plagued Western research, while the Soviet side struggled against censorship and the state’s ideological dominance, leading to inconsistencies in scholarship. Now, nearly four decades later in a world where the Soviet Union no longer exists, Taruskin’s thoughts on the reconciliation of both sides of this divide prove to be more applicable than ever, as Russia’s relationship with the West crumbles once more, threatening to put an end to growing collaboration in all aspects of research. Despite socio-political challenges, the study of Russian music has continued to develop in both Russia and the West, with numerous scholars working to bridge any sort of schism that arose as a result of political differences, or that might arise in the future. This has proved particularly difficult in recent years, as Russia begins to realign itself more closely with its Soviet past and reject collaboration with the West. This paper aims to expand on Taruskin’s work, to contemplate the effect of Soviet ideology on the study of Russian music, as well as examine current scholarship’s position, while ultimately searching for avenues for future collaboration between Russia and the West.

### **Soviet Censorship**

An important starting point for this discussion is Taruskin’s haphazardly presented idea of ‘reliable enough’ academic writing.<sup>2</sup> Before the fall of the Soviet Union and the subsequent opening of the archives in Russia, fact-checking was next to impossible, and Soviet

---

<sup>1</sup> Richard Taruskin, “Some Thoughts on the History and Historiography of Russian Music,” *The Journal of Musicology* 3, no. 4 (Autumn 1984): 322.

<sup>2</sup> *Ibid.*, 322.

scholars themselves would not have done many of the necessary corrections for fear of being persecuted by the state. Western scholars of this period, including for a time Taruskin himself, were unable to access the sources needed to conduct a proper investigation into Soviet research’s legitimacy, resulting in a propagation of ideologically imbued narratives and scholarship. Herein lies the problem with an ideological approach to scholarship: conscious or unconscious warping of the facts may occur. Whether it is from the state or from oneself, censorship poses one of the most challenging obstacles to research. It is the main issue surrounding the historiography of Russian music, making it difficult to know what is fact and what is simply state propaganda. In extreme cases, explicit misinformation occurs, and research is conducted around factually incorrect sources, further complicating the task of any external researcher. Taruskin believed in 1984 that Western scholars were too uncritically reliant on prior Soviet research, which thus further obfuscated the truth behind the ideologically manipulated narrative.<sup>3</sup> This has been a long struggle in the field of Russian music, and a corrective of these instances marks one of the main areas of focus of the discipline in the present day.

Soviet musicology is largely responsible for the present position of Russian music historiography. The career of its leading figure, musicologist and composer Boris Asafyev, clearly shows the effects of censorship and ideological pressure, as it is divided into two distinct periods. These periods reflect the change in approach to culture in the 1930s, after a time of relative freedom and experimentation in the 1920s. Asafyev was firstly a champion of modernism, a trend that was soon rejected towards the end of the 1920s. As the political situation began to shift towards tighter control from the state following the death of Vladimir Lenin, Asafyev, under pressure from the Russian Association of Proletarian Musicians, briefly abandoned his scholarly career in favour of composing for the ballet.<sup>4</sup> When he returned to musicology and musical criticism in the

---

<sup>3</sup> Ibid., 323.

<sup>4</sup> Elena Orlova, *B. Asafyev: Put issledovatelya i publitsista* [B. Asafyev: *The Path of the Researcher and Publicist*] (Leningrad: Muzyka, 1964), 242.

1940s, he was near unrecognisable, having become a mouthpiece for the party line, his work riddled with nationalist clichés.<sup>5</sup> Thanks to this, it becomes difficult to separate Asafyev's personal thoughts and those of censors, and his student Andrey Olkhovsky insists that censors did indeed heavily edit much of his work.<sup>6</sup> This was not unusual, and any attempt to satisfy censors often resulted in self-censorship. While it may occur for similar reasons as censorship, self-censorship is much more difficult to identify as it may cause an idea to be suppressed before it has even made it out of an artist or researcher's mind. It is of particular interest as it implies an understanding of the conflict between the creation and what is considered acceptable in a certain society.<sup>7</sup> Individuals who censor themselves do so in fear or knowledge that their creation goes against a particular set of beliefs, choosing not to share this with others rather than facing outside consequences.

Soviet censorship and self-censorship thus resulted in the emergence of a particular brand of scholarship, all with the sole purpose of glorifying the state and its associations with the past. This recalls Joseph Nye's concept of soft power, defined as 'the ability to obtain preferred outcomes by attraction rather than coercion or payment.'<sup>8</sup> It is a form of so-called positive propaganda, aiming to endear certain views by way of subtle suggestion. In musicological terms, by writing positively about certain topics while writing negatively, or not writing at all, about others, a musicologist can shape the scope of the discipline and, subsequently, the canon. Although the Soviet approach to censorship cannot be simply put down to soft power, as it was indeed at times quite violent and severe, the resulting

---

<sup>5</sup> Marina Frolova-Walker, *Russian Music and Nationalism: From Glinka to Stalin* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2007), 262.

<sup>6</sup> Andrey Olkhovsky, *Music Under the Soviets: The Agony of an Art* (New York: Praeger, 1955), 83.

<sup>7</sup> Annemette Kirkegaard, Helmi Järviluoma, Jan Sverre Knudsen, and Jonas Otterbeck, eds., *Researching Music Censorship* (Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2017), 6.

<sup>8</sup> Joseph Nye, "Soft Power: The Origins and Political Progress of a Concept," *Palgrave Communications* 3 (2017): 2.

trends in research encouraged scholars to continue in the fashion of work already acceptable to the state. As these approaches became the norm, scholars were less and less likely to divert from this norm, perpetuating this approach into the present day. A type of research that would not be censored was more attractive to scholars, for the simple reason of safety, creating a notion similar to that of soft power. Soft power, however, is difficult to escape, as the underlying ideological goal can eventually become imperceptible. This is indeed what has occurred in post-Soviet research, and Marina Frolova-Walker notes her surprise at the lack of a recent corrective initiative in her overview of modern Russian publications about Soviet music. She does, however, acknowledge some attempts to reframe the Soviet period from within Russia, most notably by Levon Hakobian, Inna Barsova, Igor Vorob'yov, Inna Romashchuk, Igor Vishnevetsky and Marina Raku.<sup>9</sup> These researchers are proof of the impossibility of simplifying the divide in Russian music studies to a dichotomy between Russia and the West, further complicating this already delicate question.

### **Cold War Mentalities**

The relationship between Western and Soviet scholars soured in the second half of the 20<sup>th</sup> century due to the Cold War, which discouraged cooperation across the Iron Curtain and fostered an atmosphere of disdain in regards to the opposing side. This attitude has continued into post-Cold War discourse, with Western approaches deemed superior to others, simply because they were developed within ‘our’ system and society. The West, and particularly the United States and Britain, is plagued by an ingrained sense of superiority, whereas Russia seems to suffer from a sense of inferiority, an interesting and perhaps unexpected by-product of the Cold War. As explained by Andrei Tsygankov, the concept of Russia as *Other* does not originally stem from its relationship with the United States: ‘The United States,

---

<sup>9</sup> Marina Frolova-Walker, “Soviet Music in Post-Soviet Musicology: The First Twenty Years and Beyond,” in *Russian Music Since 1917, Proceedings of the British Academy*, ed. Patrick Zuk and Marina Frolova-Walker (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2017), 111.



therefore, continued the European tradition of viewing Russia as the mirror image of the West. Such a perception has shaped the minds of Europeans ever since Russia emerged as an independent power.’<sup>10</sup> Although this dichotomy has existed for centuries, it only began to include the world’s leading superpower, the United States, during the Cold War. When peace returned towards the end of the 20th century, however, ‘U.S. elites were failing the test of inventing a new national identity free of negative comparisons with the former enemy.’<sup>11</sup> The American Cold War attitude towards Russia never truly disappeared, cultivating a mentality that Western society functions as a sort of paragon of truth to be trusted above all else, despite the fact that both sides are dominated by their own brands of ideology. The acceptability of one and not the other simply comes down to the fact that one side ‘won’ the Cold War, and the other ‘lost.’

Noam Chomsky and Edward Herman’s propaganda model serves as an interesting tool for exploration of Cold War mentalities and Soviet ideology’s effect on music historiography, despite concerning itself mostly with the United States. In their model, an ‘anti-ideology’ is defined, allowing its opposite to cultivate fear towards a potential threat. During the Cold War, the United States’ anti-ideology was communism, socialism, and the ‘Soviet Menace,’ depicted as systems that endangered freedom and the United States’ own ideology (capitalism).<sup>12</sup> Providing a society with its opposite and portraying it in an overwhelmingly negative fashion serves as a method of control similar to that of Nye’s previously discussed soft power. Staring at such a dangerous and oppressive alternative, members of a society are more likely to accept their own society irrespective of its own flaws. In scholarly research, this attitude becomes troublingly problematic, as it assumes the superiority of

---

<sup>10</sup> Andrei P. Tsygankov, “Russia has an Inferiority Complex, America has a Superiority Complex,” *Opinions: Russia in Global Affairs*, August 6, 2014.

<sup>11</sup> Ibid.

<sup>12</sup> Andrew Mullen, “The Propaganda Model after 20 Years: Interview with Edward S. Herman and Noam Chomsky,” *Westminster Papers in Communication and Culture*, November 2009, [http://www.wmin.ac.uk/mad/pdf/WPCC-Vol6-No2-Andrew\\_Mullen\\_interview.pdf](http://www.wmin.ac.uk/mad/pdf/WPCC-Vol6-No2-Andrew_Mullen_interview.pdf).

research from one socio-political milieu over another. Despite the clear ideological bias that occurs in some scholarship out of Russia, Western scholarship must be wary of grouping all Russian researchers into one group that cannot be trusted. This is simply not the case, and it is with collaboration, not condescension, that our discipline will move forward. Frolova-Walker sees promise in the post-Soviet collaboration between Russia and the West, stating, '[t]he great progress of Soviet music studies in the past 25 years was mainly due to the removal of ideological barriers, the opening of the archives and active exchange and collaboration between post-Soviet and Western scholars.'<sup>13</sup> Without collaboration, the study of Russian music would not have progressed as far as it has, and without it, it will surely die.

To return to Taruskin's 1984 article, his desire to correct Russian music historiography also extends to a misunderstanding of Russian structures, institutions, and priorities by Western scholars. As with any cultural divide, becoming a scholar of any region of the world that is not one's own presents a learning curve and challenges. Taruskin believes that this learning curve has made it so that Western scholars have often focused on certain traits of Russian music at the expense of others. This is most notable in discussions of 'Russianness,' which Taruskin claims at the time of writing were filled with 'lazy habits of thought.'<sup>14</sup> These refer to the need to associate every aspect of Russian music with the national question rather than appreciating the vast cultural and political landscape in which Russian music came to be. Such an approach results in a far different scholarly narrative for the region from the West than from internal scholars. The conflicting narratives contribute to the divide in the discipline, and when framed with Cold War attitudes, prioritise one type of research over the other. This, of course, prioritises the Western side, despite the internal Russian side likely benefiting from greater access to sources and a greater understanding of the context surrounding the research.

---

<sup>13</sup> Marina Frolova-Walker, "An Inclusive History for a Divided World?" *Journal of the Royal Music Association* 143, no. 1 (2018): 14.

<sup>14</sup> Taruskin, "Some Thoughts on the History and Historiography of Russian Music," 323.

### **Present-Day Russian Music Historiography**

The remains of Soviet censorship and Cold War attitudes have left Russian music historiography in a unique position, likely to continue to grow in complication as the relationship between Russia and the West takes another negative turn. As Frolova-Walker writes, '[w]hat once seemed only the beginning of an open-ended process of transition and change [...] now looks like a distinct period, a period that has ended.'<sup>15</sup> A shift in post-Soviet attitudes has left any cross-cultural discipline in a precarious position, as Russia has recently begun to realign itself with its Soviet past, and the Russian government's methods of control become eerily similar to those of Soviet times. The recent clampdown on dissent in Russia has created a hostile environment for research, as well as an attempt to discredit Western researchers, particularly in their research on controversial topics such as homosexuality, religion, and relationships with the West. This is most evident in the handling of Pyotr Tchaikovsky's sexuality, a long-time source of disagreement between Russia and the West, now brought back to the forefront of the discipline thanks to Russia's anti-gay propaganda law.

In 2010, Russian psychiatrists believed that they had proved, through psychoanalyses of his works and writings, that Tchaikovsky was indeed not gay. One of these psychiatrists, Mikhail Buyanov, stated that '[s]ex as such was of little interest to him [because] he had greater concerns.'<sup>16</sup> From a study of Tchaikovsky's writings, they concluded that women who failed to gain his attention spread rumours of his sexuality as revenge.<sup>17</sup> Sadly, any research on Tchaikovsky coming out of present-day Russia must be met with a slightly critical eye, not because it is not of value but because of the political context in which it is undertaken. Russia's anti-gay propaganda law, which passed unanimously in June of 2013, makes it illegal to equate straight and gay relationships, illegal to distribute gay

---

<sup>15</sup> Frolova-Walker, "Soviet Music in Post-Soviet Musicology: The First Twenty Years and Beyond," 98.

<sup>16</sup> Simon Morrison, "Waist-deep: In the mire of Russian and Western debates about Tchaikovsky," *The Times Literary Supplement*, May 1, 2015.

<sup>17</sup> Ibid.

rights materials, illegal to expose minors to propaganda of non-traditional sexual relations, and illegal to dissimulate information about these relations in mass media, creating an insurmountable problem for Tchaikovsky scholars.<sup>18</sup> This is not to say that all Russian scholarship is misinformed or wrong; there are many Russian scholars who have and still do acknowledge the composer’s sexuality, standing with their colleagues in the West, including Konstantin Rotikov, who writes, ‘[i]n the case of Tchaikovsky his homosexuality is so well documented by his own writings and the writings of others that it is simply ludicrous to suggest otherwise. It’s a historical fact. History doesn’t change just because we are trying to push a certain agenda today.’<sup>19</sup> Today’s challenge to Western historians of Russian music is thus reminiscent of that of their counterparts during Soviet times. The study of Russian music is endlessly complicated by socio-political ideology and beliefs, but the discovery of once-hidden sources continues to help us find a truth that ideology cannot touch. Despite this, Russia’s move away from the West will continue to put a strain on possible collaboration and lead to two distinct strands of scholarship in the study of Russian music.

### Some Thoughts for the Future

Richard Taruskin concluded his 1984 overview of Russian music historiography with the following words: ‘[t]he best answer to the question, “What is to be done,” may simply be “Let things continue; they’re going well.”’<sup>20</sup> In the following forty years, Russia’s relationship with the West has seen many changes, but it is currently at a low point that makes Taruskin’s conclusion ill-suited. As Marina

---

<sup>18</sup> Justine De Kerf, “Anti-Gay Propaganda Laws: Time for the European Court of Human Rights to Overcome Her Fear of Commitment,” *DiGeSt: Journal of Diversity and Gender Studies* 4, no. 1 (2017): 36.

<sup>19</sup> Shaun Walker, “Tchaikovsky was not gay, says Russian culture minister,” *The Guardian*, September 18, 2013.  
<https://www.theguardian.com/music/2013/sep/18/tchaikovsky-not-gay-russian-minister>.

<sup>20</sup> Taruskin, “Some Thoughts on the History and Historiography of Russian Music,” 339.

Frolova-Walker describes, we risk a new type of cultural Cold War as Russian policy further distances itself from the West. She believes that '[t]oday, the lines dividing our world are drawn differently, and we should recognise this and respond to this new situation,'<sup>21</sup> a statement in opposition of Taruskin's desire to let things continue. Due to the recent crumbling of Russia's relationship with the West, there is a risk of creating new boundaries once again in the style of the old Cold War dichotomy. By continuing with its anti-Russian sentiment remaining from the Cold War, the West is pushing Russia into returning to an ideology that sees it as *Other* in a negative way, reminiscent of the pre-Soviet struggle to culturally differentiate Russia from the West. Vladimir Stasov, ideological leader of the 'Slavophiles' of the 19<sup>th</sup> century, who was vehemently opposed to Western ideas, claimed that, '[t]he time has come to stop transplanting foreign institutions to our country and to give some thought to what would really be beneficial and suitable to our soil and our national character.'<sup>22</sup> To fully return to such an attitude would be fatal to collaboration and to the longevity of Russian music studies.

It is, however, simply impossible to predict how politics and ideology will continue to affect art and culture, and impossible to have everyone conform to a single narrative in Russian music studies. This, in turn, makes it impossible to propose a clear path to collaboration. I would like instead to stress important steps for further research that will contribute to this collaborative atmosphere and the growth of the discipline: context in such a discipline is of paramount importance, as it will allow us to fairly question the legitimacy of sources in the hopes that we can eventually separate reality from political manipulations. It is also crucial for Western scholars to abandon this harmful Cold War mentality of Western superiority and recognise the contributions of Russian scholars, many of whom are working hard to escape the Soviet approach to research. Most importantly and most simply, in order to ensure the survival of the discipline, it is necessary to continue

---

<sup>21</sup> Frolova-Walker, "An Inclusive History for a Divided World?" 20.

<sup>22</sup> Vladimir Stasov, *Selected Essays on Music*, trans. Florence Jonas (New York: Praeger, 1968), 83.

approaching material critically, continue with our curiosities, and continue to resist the political changes that threaten international collaboration.

## Bibliography

- De Kerf, Justine. "Anti-Gay Propaganda Laws: Time for the European Court of Human Rights to Overcome Her Fear of Commitment." *DiGeSt: Journal of Diversity and Gender Studies* 4, no. 1 (2017): 35–48.
- Frolova-Walker, Marina. "An Inclusive History for a Divided World?" *Journal of the Royal Music Association* 143, no. 1 (2018): 1–20.
- Frolova-Walker, Marina. *Russian Music and Nationalism: From Glinka to Stalin*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2007.
- Frolova-Walker, Marina. "Soviet Music in Post-Soviet Musicology: The First Twenty Years and Beyond." In *Russian Music Since 1917, Proceedings of the British Academy*, edited by Patrick Zuk and Marina Frolova-Walker, 98–124. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2017.
- Kirkegaard, Annemette, Helmi Järviluoma, Jan Sverre Knudsen, and Jonas Otterbeck, eds. *Researching Music Censorship*. Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2017.
- Morrison, Simon. "Waist-deep: In the mire of Russian and Western debates about Tchaikovsky." *The Times Literary Supplement*. May 1, 2015.
- Mullen, Andrew. "The Propaganda Model after 20 Years: Interview with Edward S. Herman and Noam Chomsky." *Westminster Papers in Communication and Culture*. November 2009. [http://www.wmin.ac.uk/mad/pdf/WPCC-Vol6-No2-Andrew\\_Mullen\\_interview.pdf](http://www.wmin.ac.uk/mad/pdf/WPCC-Vol6-No2-Andrew_Mullen_interview.pdf).
- Nye, Joseph. "Soft Power: The Origins and Political Progress of a Concept." *Palgrave Communications* 3 (2017): 1–3.
- Olkhovsky, Andrey. *Music Under the Soviets: The Agony of an Art*. New York: Praeger, 1955.
- Orlova, Elena. *B. Asafyev: Put issledovatelya i publitsista [B. Asafyev: The Path of the Researcher and Publicist]*. Leningrad: Muzyka, 1964.
- Stasov, Vladimir. *Selected Essays on Music*. Translated by Florence Jonas. New York: Praeger, 1968).
- Taruskin, Richard. "Some Thoughts on the History and

Historiography of Russian Music." *The Journal of Musicology* 3, no. 4 (Autumn 1984): 321–39.

Tsygankov, Andrei P. "Russia has an Inferiority Complex, America has a Superiority Complex." *Opinions: Russia in Global Affairs*. August 6, 2014.

Walker, Shaun. "Tchaikovsky was not gay, says Russian culture minister." *The Guardian*. September 18, 2013. <https://www.theguardian.com/music/2013/sep/18/tchaikovsky-not-gay-russian-minister>.



## ***The Three-Cornered Hat* and Constructions of Spanish Identity**

*Rhiannon Crompton*

### **Abstract**

This paper examines the contrasting premieres of *The Three-Cornered Hat* in Spain and abroad. The ballet received a much less favourable response in Madrid, with Spanish audiences deeming the performance an inauthentic representation of Spain. Frequently cited as an example of a nationalist work, I will determine the extent to which wider European ideals and expectations of a Spanish national identity were responsible in constructing this perception. I argue that a distinctly 'Spanish' musical style, largely derived from the region of Andalusia, had been pre-established in Europe, thus adherence to such parameters by artists was an attempt to appeal to European audiences. *The Three-Cornered Hat* is one such example; through analysis of the ballet's narrative, music and designs, I demonstrate how the work was reconfigured by Sergei Diaghilev in an attempt to cater to an international audience. Subsequently, issues relating to authentic constructions of a national musical identity are raised. In particular, I question the elevation of nationality as a criterion for judgement. Ultimately, I propose that both authenticity and nationalism should be regarded as ideological constructs as opposed to objective and obtainable facts. In order to actively challenge existing beliefs and perceptions surrounding so-called 'Spanish' music, a cross-cultural dialogue must be initiated. Musical identity should be regarded as a discourse of subjectivity, rather than a mere categorisation of identity.

### **Biography**

**Rhiannon Crompton** holds a Bachelor of Music degree from the University of Birmingham and an MSt in Musicology from the University of Oxford. Her research interests include ballet music, Spain, and nationalism, against the broader backdrop of the late nineteenth and twentieth-centuries. She currently works as a teacher and writer, whilst continuing to perform as a pianist in a range of settings.

**Keywords:** Manuel de Falla, Spain, Nationalism, Ballet, Identity

**Affiliation:** University of Oxford, Oxford, United Kingdom

**Email address:** rhiannonjcrompton@gmail.com

If challenged to describe 'Spanish' music, an unequivocal image likely comes to mind. Through flaunting castanets, habanera rhythms and guitar-based sonorities, countless composers have successfully fashioned a picture-postcard depiction of Spain from the confines of the concert hall. However, Spain's musical heritage encompasses far more than this distinctly recognisable image. Notions of national identity are routinely discussed amongst scholars, yet constructions of so-called 'Spanish' music are often overlooked without obvious cause. It is therefore my intention to challenge existing beliefs: what does an 'authentic' Spanish music look like, and who has, or should have, the authority to decide this? An extended discussion on this topic is beyond the scope of this paper, but I propose that notions of authenticity and nationality should be approached in a way that allows for greater fluidity and evolvment. By examining the initial responses to *The Three-Cornered Hat*, a work heralded for its blatant Hispanic qualities, I intend to determine the extent to which wider European ideals and expectations surrounding 'Spanish' music were responsible in constructing this perception. In doing so, I ask what constituted 'Spanish' music in the eyes of European audiences in the early twentieth century, and to what degree is this an accurate representation of Spanish culture?

### **The Contrasting Premieres of *The Three-Cornered Hat***

*The Three-Cornered Hat* was first performed at the Alhambra Theatre in London, conducted by Ernest Ansermet, on 22 July 1919. The decision to stage the world premiere in London was a strategic one. Spanish music had seen a recent rise in popularity in Britain, due to the contemporary political climate: the events of the First World War had caused an increased rejection of Germanic music, reflecting the nationalist movement of the previous century. Furthermore, prior to 1919, Falla had enjoyed a 'decidedly enthusiastic response from British reviewers.'<sup>1</sup> His latest work therefore incited interest amongst British

---

<sup>1</sup> Eva Moreda Rodriguez, "'How little we know in this country of the music of Spain...': Spanish music in Britain during the First World War", *First World War Studies* 14, no. 3 (2013), 251.

audiences, which was only heightened by the involvement of arguably the most prominent dance company of the twentieth century: The Ballets Russes. Pablo Picasso had also been commissioned to produce the designs, in his first work for a ballet. The prospect of such a high-profile artistic collaboration therefore attracted a great deal of anticipation ahead of the ballet's first performance. Understandably, then, London was the most rational choice; *The Three-Cornered Hat* was likely to receive fulsome praise from British audiences.

As predicted, the ballet's premiere in London was an emphatic success. Critical reviews were overwhelmingly positive, with most declaring the ballet an 'out-and-out triumph.'<sup>2</sup> One reviewer noted that 'the enthusiasm [...] defies description. It was tremendous. There is no other word.'<sup>3</sup> Another counted fourteen separate curtain calls.<sup>4</sup> In particular, the reaction to Falla's score verged on the euphoric: 'the London critics waxed exuberant. They applauded the ballet as the perfect expression of Spanish "spirit, character, and temperament," with Falla's score "as national in form and character as anything well could be."<sup>5</sup> The performance was repeatedly praised for its 'Spanish' disposition. Indeed, almost without exception critics noted the universal appeal of 'Spanish' music, of which they declared *The Three-Cornered Hat* a perfect example.<sup>6</sup>

A year later, the London premiere was followed by the ballet's first performance in Paris, which was equally well-received. Similarly to the response in London, Parisian critics attributed the work's success to its quintessentially Spanish qualities.<sup>7</sup> Falla's 'profound observation of.... a country and of a race' and his ability 'to create

---

<sup>2</sup> Chris Collins, "Falla in Britain", *The Musical Times* 144, no. 1883 (2003), 33.

<sup>3</sup> Anon., 'See them dance the jota!', *The Sporting Times* (26 July 1919), 3.

<sup>4</sup> *The Evening News* (23 July 1919), 7.

<sup>5</sup> Carol A. Hess, *Sacred Passions: The Life and Music of Manuel de Falla* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008), 119.

<sup>6</sup> Carol A. Hess, "Manuel de Falla's the three-cornered hat and the right-wing press in pre-civil war Spain", *Journal of Musicological Research* 15, no. 1 (1 January 1995), 55.

<sup>7</sup> Carol A. Hess, *Manuel de Falla and Modernism in Spain 1898-1936* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2001), 130.

Hispanism' was applauded.<sup>8</sup> Consequently, both the ballet in its entirety and Falla's score in isolation were hailed by critics in London and Paris as the embodiment of 'Spanish' qualities. In Madrid, however, the ballet was to receive a starkly different response.

*The Three-Cornered Hat* was not performed in Spain until 5 April 1921, almost two years after its initial premiere, at the Teatro Real in Madrid. Falla had gained even greater popularity in Spain by this point, in the wake of the ballet's success abroad. Subsequently, the extended delay imposed upon Spanish audiences only fuelled the anticipation surrounding the performance. However, perhaps due to these great expectations, the result was, in the eyes of many, one of disappointment. Critical responses ranged from mild scepticism to complete dismay. Critics 'found the ironic score, flamboyant choreography, and "cubist" set a travesty of the national image. With epithets like "misguided," "arbitrary," "grotesque," and "untrue to the Spanish soul," they attacked the ballet on both artistic and philosophical grounds.'<sup>9</sup> In reference to the original novel upon which the ballet was based, one critic known only as 'B.' stated that '*El sombrero de tres picos* has been ruined in a thorough and definitive manner.'<sup>10</sup>

Of all the artists involved, those of Spanish heritage were by far the most harshly reprimanded. The distaste expressed by critics was therefore grounded in a sense of national pride, a deep discontent with the presentation of their homeland. In terms of engendering a national music, Spain's long-established history of regionality creates further complications. Given the country's regional and cultural diversity, a Spanish national music would presumably encompass a wide array of forms, origins, and styles. However, characteristic 'Spanish' idioms employed by Falla in *The Three-Cornered Hat* originated from Andalusia, the southernmost region of Spain. The term *andalucismo* is used to refer to this catalogue of musical gestures: 'phrygian melodic

---

<sup>8</sup> Howard Mayer Brown, *Music in the Renaissance* (New Jersey: Prentice Hall, 1976), 242.

<sup>9</sup> Hess, "Manuel de Falla's the three-cornered hat and the right-wing press in pre-civil war Spain", 56.

<sup>10</sup> B., "El sombrero de tres picos", *La Acción* (6 April 1921).

turns, hemiola, rhythmically free *fioratura*, castanets, and hand clapping,' amongst others.<sup>11</sup> Felipe Pedrell, Falla's former teacher, likely influenced Falla's compositional approach. An established musicologist and composer, Pedrell advocated for a Spanish national school of music. However, most of the folkloric idioms championed by Pedrell, and which infiltrated the work of his students, originated from Andalusia. This accounts for the negative response from Spanish audiences; a singular strand of Spanish culture was typified and shown to exemplify Spanish music in its entirety. *Andalucismo* provided an inherently narrow depiction of Spain.

This Andalusian style had previously been utilised by composers across the continent, in an attempt to fashion a recognisable Spanish pastiche. Between Glinka's Spanish Overtures, Bizet's *Carmen*, and Rimsky-Korsakov's *Capriccio Espagnol*, an idealised version of Spain had won wide appeal and commercial success across Europe prior to the turn of the twentieth century. Foreign nations dictated and implemented a definitive 'Spanish' style, in a display of their continued superiority. Spain's exoticism was its greatest asset; 'modern Europe could be saved by becoming "Spanishised"; there was little to be gained by Europeanising Spain.'<sup>12</sup> Attempts to alter this familiar portrayal of Spain's musical culture would have been largely futile. Therefore, the choice by Spanish musicians to draw upon *andalucismo* was often, to an extent, a calculated and deliberate decision. The Andalusian style was already recognisably 'Spanish' to a wider European audience, thus Spanish musicians knew that by composing in such a way, their work would likely be far more successful abroad. Using its perceived exoticism to their advantage, certain Spanish composers exploited this pre-established notion of 'Spanish' music in order to obtain critical acclaim and elevate the artistic reputation of their homeland.

---

<sup>11</sup> Hess, *Sacred Passions: The Life and Music of Manuel de Falla*, 19.

<sup>12</sup> Stanley G. Payne, "Spanish Nationalism in the Twentieth Century", *The Review of Politics* 26, no. 3 (1964), 405.

### Diaghilev's Eurocentric Approach

Upon closer examination, it is evident that *The Three-Cornered Hat* was deliberately marketed to a wider European audience. Initially, the score was composed for a pantomime based upon Pedro Antonio de Alarcón's novel *El sombrero de tres picos*. Falla was not the first, nor the only composer to have set this tale to music; most notably, Hugo Wolf's opera *Der Corregidor* (1896) is based on the same plot. The narrative is one of jealousy and mistaken identity, which culminates in the triumph of morality. A devoutly religious man, the novel's good-humoured treatment of traditional values alongside its ideological implications likely appealed to Falla's sensibilities. The original scoring was performed in 1917 in Madrid, under the title *El corregidor y la molinera* (*The Magistrate and the Miller's Wife*), to great success. It is not unlikely that this would have been the final and definitive version, had it not been brought to the attention of Sergei Diaghilev, the director of the Ballets Russes.

Under Diaghilev's direction, the original pantomime was altered considerably. Several modifications concerned the plot: in a dehumanising act, the character's names were eliminated and replaced with generic labels such as 'Miller' and 'Miller's Wife.' Alarcón's emphasis on conjugal devotion was entirely abandoned, with the Miller's Wife instead portrayed as bored and dissatisfied, to the point of flirting with the Corregidor.<sup>13</sup> The ending also underwent significant modification - in the original story, the married couple reunite with a solemn promise, whereas the ballet's finale is filled with raucous abandon. An intimate confession is replaced with public ridicule.<sup>14</sup> Moreover, the events would now unfold on St. John's Eve, or summer solstice, when spirits and revellers are traditionally said to cause mischief.<sup>15</sup> The resultant effect was a melodramatic and stereotypical portrayal of a Spanish community.

---

<sup>13</sup> Léonide Massine, *My Life in Ballet*, ed. Phyllis Hartnoll and Robert Rubens (London: Macmillan, 1968), 142.

<sup>14</sup> Hess, "Manuel de Falla's the three-cornered hat and the right-wing press in pre-civil war Spain", 60.

<sup>15</sup> Hess, *Manuel de Falla and Modernism in Spain 1898-1936*, 116.

A clichéd illustration of Spain was also enforced by Picasso's designs. The largest component was a drop curtain, displayed during the overture to the accompaniment of drums, fanfares, castanets, a Spanish singer, and cries of ‘Olé!’.<sup>16</sup> The original design is pictured below.



Figure 5.1: Pablo Picasso's curtain for *The Three-Cornered Hat* (1919). Collection: New York Historical Society, Estate of Pablo Picasso/Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York.

<sup>16</sup> Alastair Macaulay, “Behind Picasso’s Curtain, the Ballet That Got Away”, *New York Times* (4 June 2015), accessed 24 February 2020, <https://www.nytimes.com/2015/06/04/arts/dance/behind-picassos-curtain-the-ballet-that-got-away.html>.



The curtain depicts a bull fight, a cultural trope which plays no part in the narrative of the ballet. In particular, Picasso's curtain lacked geographical specificity: 'all local sentiment has vanished. Andalusia? Galicia? Mallorca? [...] all the same' remarked one critic at the premiere in Madrid.<sup>17</sup> The issue was no longer concerned with stereotyping of a single region, but the fact that Spain's regionality had been abandoned entirely - and by a native Spaniard, no less. This understandably caused considerable outrage, with another critic declaring that 'like Falla, Picasso not only misunderstood the Spanish tradition, but allowed himself to be caught up in the latest artistic fashions.'<sup>18</sup> Creative artists therefore endeavoured to align their work with European trends, rather than a genuine Spanish image. As a result, the international audience mistook a 'generic' Spain for an 'authentic' one.

There were additional alterations to Falla's score. Originally devised for a modest string orchestra, the orchestration was expanded to include a solo soprano, three flutes, piccolo, two oboes, cor anglais, two clarinets, two bassoons, four horns, three trumpets, three trombones, tuba, timpani and percussion, harp, piano, celeste, and strings. Diaghilev conveyed Picasso's suggestion that Falla add voices to the score, given that Picasso 'thinks this would be very Spanish.'<sup>19</sup> More accurately, he meant to convey that this would seem 'very Spanish' to foreign audiences. Furthermore, Falla adapted the pantomime's ending, interweaving new motives to transform it into the colossal 'Jota.'<sup>20</sup> This traditional Spanish dance 'often contains a prominent castanet part and has been widely imitated by non-Spanish composers'; Falla incorporated blatant horn calls, castanets, and the bombastic simplicity of a steadfast alternation between the tonic and

---

<sup>17</sup> Hess, *Manuel de Falla and Modernism in Spain 1898-1936*, 136.

<sup>18</sup> Hess, "Manuel de Falla's the three-cornered hat and the right-wing press in pre-civil war Spain", 62.

<sup>19</sup> Letter, Diaghilev to Falla, 10 May 1919, cited in Jorge de Persia, *Poesía*, Monograph dedicated to Manuel de Falla, nos. 36 and 37 (Madrid: Ministry of Culture, 1991), 124.

<sup>20</sup> Hess, *Sacred Passions: The Life and Music of Manuel de Falla*, 114.

dominant.<sup>21</sup> The score was therefore altered such that it mirrored the exaggerated *andalucismo* employed by select European composers.

At the premiere of *The Three-Cornered Hat* in Spain, critics 'blamed what they perceived as the ballet's caricaturesque view of Spain on its creators' blind adherence to the latest foreign trends.'<sup>22</sup> By 1921, Falla had begun to compose in a more 'modernist' style, reminiscent of Stravinsky's neoclassicism - *Noches en los jardines de España* received its premiere in Spain earlier that same year. This polarity between 'nationalist' and 'modernist' music partially explains why Spanish critics condemned the musical style employed by Falla in *The Three-Cornered Hat*. Spanish audiences were under the impression that 'to be integrated into European mainstream music, there had to be some separation from nationalism.'<sup>23</sup> To then hear the traditionalist idioms of *The Three-Cornered Hat* indicated a sharp stylistic contrast. The ballet was branded a genre for exportation, which served only to attract publicity.<sup>24</sup> It was not representative of the extent of Spain's artistic capabilities; what Spanish audiences saw in *The Three-Cornered Hat* was an exaggerated caricature, one which only enhanced their sense of national inferiority.

The final product was excessively caricaturesque in comparison to the original pantomime. Diaghilev's sensationalist attitude, combined with Falla's accommodation of foreign expectations, resulted in a broadly stereotypical delineation of Spanish culture. Diaghilev's approach exceeded the limited depiction offered by *andalucismo*, as the concept of regionalism was forsaken entirely. *The Three-Cornered Hat* became an artificial and reductive construction, catered towards the tastes of an international audience. It is therefore an example of how external European artists and audiences successfully shaped the nature of Spanish nationalism, by encouraging specific musical and extramusical parameters.

---

<sup>21</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>22</sup> Hess, *Manuel de Falla and Modernism in Spain 1898-1936*, 131.

<sup>23</sup> Burnett James, *Manuel de Falla and the Spanish Musical Renaissance* (London: Gollancz, 1979), 73.

<sup>24</sup> B. "El sombrero de tres picos".

### An 'Authentic' Spanish Music

Following the initial premieres of *The Three-Cornered Hat*, there was no consensus on what constituted the 'real' Spain. Where Parisian and British critics heard good humour and Spanish colour, Madrid's critics registered irony and disrespect.<sup>25</sup> A particular image of Spain prevailed across the continent, which Spanish audiences deemed to be inaccurate. Admittedly, those in Spain were perhaps more likely to express disapproval at a glaringly 'inauthentic' Spanish work. Furthermore, a lack of awareness is not entirely the fault of wider European audiences; having never been exposed to alternative depictions, they were largely oblivious to the ostensible inauthenticity of the presented performance. Nonetheless, the issue of authenticity raises notable concerns in the context of nationalist music.

In particular, one highly contestable attribute is the elevation of the composer's nationality into a criterion for judgement: 'the opinion of those perceived as "native" Spaniards tends to be given more credit, unless musical proficiency or scholarship is believed to compensate for a sense of non-belongingness.'<sup>26</sup> Using nationality to judge the degree to which a work is 'authentic' is objectionable for a number of reasons. Despite being heralded as the foremost Spanish composer of the twentieth century, Falla spent several years residing in Paris, where he exerted a profound impact on the French musical scene whilst absorbing the work of his French contemporaries. The dialogical exchange between French and Spanish musicians resident in Paris in the early twentieth century meant that all were exposed to near-identical influences; national identities evolved and were subject to competing cultural, political and social factors. Moreover, concerning Spanish music specifically, countless composers attempted to emulate *andalucismo*. If nationality is favoured above all else, the music of Debussy, Ravel and Rimsky-Korsakov amongst others is relegated to mere pastiche. Yet Falla publicly praised Debussy's evocations of Spain: 'Debussy, who did not actually know Spain,

---

<sup>25</sup> Hess, "Manuel de Falla's the three-cornered hat and the right-wing press in pre-civil war Spain", 59.

<sup>26</sup> Samuel Llano, *Whose Spain?: Negotiating "Spanish Music" in Paris, 1908-1929* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013), xv.

spontaneously, I dare say unconsciously, created such Spanish music as was to arouse the envy of many who knew her only too well.’<sup>27</sup> Nationality is understood to be representative of an imagined community, but it is individuals who are subject to categorisation in order to determine nationality and subsequently a degree of authenticity. Individuals are assessed on the basis of an entire community, which they are incapable of encompassing. Such an approach is evidently flawed.

It would therefore be more productive to consider authenticity as an ideological construct, rather than an objective and obtainable fact. Expectations surrounding authenticity evolve over time, yet criteria denoting what constitutes an ‘authentic’ Spanish style has remained largely stagnant. Consequently, greater emphasis should be placed on how communities define, or more accurately understand, authenticity. Given its intersections with nationalism, this approach would also be beneficial when considering national styles. From an anthropological standpoint, the work of Regina Bendix translates well here. Bendix argues against dichotomous approaches to authenticity which have previously pervaded scholarly discussions.<sup>28</sup> Such notions of authenticity fuelled cultural nationalism worldwide, fostering national causes and results, of which the polarising response to *The Three-Cornered Hat* is one example. And while evidently still felt to some degree, such an assessment lacks the vital nuance needed to discuss such topics. Ultimately, ‘the search for authenticity is fundamentally an emotional and moral quest,’ one which has historically resulted in a troubling series of attempts to pinpoint the ineffable.<sup>29</sup>

It is not my intention to define Spanish music; indeed, a comprehensive account of all interpretations of Spanish music is beyond the scope of this paper. Nevertheless, notions of national music are much more nuanced than is historically maintained, thus strict distinctions between styles are neither helpful nor productive in

---

<sup>27</sup> Falla, *On Music and Musicians*, 42.

<sup>28</sup> Regina Bendix, *In Search of Authenticity: The Formation of Folklore Studies* (Wisconsin: University of Wisconsin Press, 1997).

<sup>29</sup> Bendix, *In Search of Authenticity: The Formation of Folklore Studies*, 7.

advancing the cultural dialogue. Whilst I do not intend to disregard or deny the usefulness of constructing relationships and comparisons through analysis, an alternative framework could provide novel perspectives, through which the category of 'Spanish' can be expanded. In this light, Carl Dahlhaus not only allows but advocates for a degree of subjectivity: 'national significance or colouring of a musical phenomenon is to no small degree a matter of the way it is received by audiences.'<sup>30</sup> Different communities have juxtaposing opinions concerning what is truly 'Spanish,' as proven by the contrasting responses to *The Three-Cornered Hat*. Perceptions therefore vary depending primarily upon socio-cultural, not musical, factors: 'what does and does not count as national depends primarily on collective opinion.'<sup>31</sup>

Little effort has been made to actively challenge our inherited assumptions surrounding 'Spanish' music and national identity. The need for a critical reappraisal of Spanish music is urgent, not only to prevent certain works being discarded from performance repertoires entirely, but to ensure the preservation of Spanish musical culture. If no change occurs, a narrow, highly stylised depiction of Spain will continue to be enforced. The issue is not what is 'Spanish', but that the category of 'Spanish' needs to be expanded.

In summary, I return to the original story of *The Three-Cornered Hat*, or *El sombrero de tres picos*. The tale is one of authority and the abuse of authority, resolved through communication and an uncovering of the truth. In order to diversify international notions of 'Spanish' music, a cross-cultural dialogue must be initiated which can begin to bridge the divide between Spanish and other cultural ideologies, whilst challenging existing beliefs and preconceptions surrounding their musical traditions. This would support a more fluid approach to identity that is reflective of its evolving nature as a national and cultural tradition. Consequently, the notion of 'Spanish' music will encompass a range of novel perspectives, and Spain will

---

<sup>30</sup> Carl Dahlhaus, *Between Romanticism and Modernism: Four Studies in the Music of the Later Nineteenth Century* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1980), 87.

<sup>31</sup> *Ibid.*

move towards the musical centre, having long been resigned to its periphery. In other words, musical identity should be regarded as a discourse of subjectivity, rather than a mere categorisation of identity.

## Bibliography

- Anon. "See them dance the jota!" *The Sporting Times*, 26 July 1919.
- B. "El sombrero de tres picos." *La Acción*, 6 April 1921.
- Bendix, Regina. *In Search of Authenticity: The Formation of Folklore Studies*. Wisconsin: University of Wisconsin Press, 1997.
- Brown, Howard Mayer. *Music in the Renaissance*. New Jersey: Prentice Hall, 1976.
- Collins, Chris. "Falla in Britain." *The Musical Times* 144, no. 1883 (2003): 33-48.
- Dahlhaus, Carl. *Between Romanticism and Modernism: Four Studies in the Music of the Later Nineteenth Century*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1980.
- Falla, Manuel de. *El sombrero de tres picos*. London: J. & W. Chester, 1921.
- Hess, Carol A. "Manuel de Falla's the three-cornered hat and the right-wing press in pre-civil war Spain." *Journal of Musicological Research* 15, no. 1 (1 January 1995): 55-84.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Manuel de Falla and Modernism in Spain 1898-1936*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2001.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Sacred Passions: The Life and Music of Manuel de Falla*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008.
- James, Burnett. *Manuel de Falla and the Spanish Musical Renaissance*. London: Gollancz, 1979.
- Llano, Samuel. *Whose Spain?: Negotiating "Spanish Music" in Paris, 1908-1929*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013.
- Macaulay, Alastair. "Behind Picasso's Curtain, the Ballet That Got Away." *New York Times*, 4 June 2015. Accessed 24 February 2020. <https://www.nytimes.com/2015/06/04/arts/dance/behind-picassos-curtain-the-ballet-that-got-away.html>.
- Massine, Léonide. *My Life in Ballet*, edited by Phyllis Hartnoll and Robert Rubens. London: Macmillan, 1968.
- Moreda Rodriguez, Eva. "'How little we know in this country of the music of Spain...': Spanish music in Britain during the First World War." *First World War Studies* 14, no. 3 (2013): 241-256.
- Payne, Stanley G. "Spanish Nationalism in the Twentieth Century."

*The Review of Politics* 26, no. 3 (1964): 403-422.

Persia, Jorge de. *Poesía*. Monograph dedicated to Manuel de Falla, nos. 36 and 37. Madrid: Ministry of Culture, 1991.

The Evening News, 23 July 1919.



## The Construction of Beethoven's Myth in China

*Gangcan Tian*

### Abstract

One of the earliest to have introduced Beethoven to the Chinese was Chinese artist Shutong Li. Through his 1906 article 'the Sage of Music' and charcoal portrait of the composer, he established a mythical image of Beethoven that has had a lasting influence on the Chinese reception of this composer, particularly in terms of the construction of Beethoven's myth in China. However, Li's charcoal portrait, strongly influenced by traditional Chinese mythology and Confucianism, is strikingly different from many Western portraits of Beethoven. As Alessandra Comini points out, the image of Beethoven changes in relation to different cultures. More importantly, the mythmaking of Beethoven is not simply passed down unchanged from generation to generation; rather, it is a continuous process of recreation.

The reception of Beethoven in China has been covered by a number of scholars, yet existing literature mainly focuses on the exploration of the changing image of Beethoven in China under the influence of politics with the reception theory; less explored are ways in which the Beethoven image is shaped through the process of mythmaking. This paper aims to explore the construction of the Beethoven myth in China in relation to the surrounding social and cultural contexts. After discussing traditional Chinese myth in relation to the making of Beethoven's mythmaking in Europe and China, this paper will analyse several significant Chinese portraits of Beethoven that have a significant influence on the Chinese reception of the composer, comparing them with well-known European portraits of Beethoven, to see the construction of the Chinese Beethoven myth.

**Biography**

**Gangcan Tian** is from China and obtained her MMus in the University of Edinburgh. She is interested in intercultural musical exchanges between China and the West.

**Keywords:** Beethoven, mythmaking, China, iconography, portrait

**Affiliation:** The University of Edinburgh, Edinburgh, UK

**Email address:** s1854352@ed.ac.uk

One of the earliest artists to have introduced Beethoven to the Chinese was Shutong Li. His article 'The Sage of Music' was published in the oldest Chinese musical magazine *Little Magazine of Music* in 1906 and was accompanied by a charcoal portrait of the composer. Both works brought the Chinese into direct contact with this musical titan of the West, establishing an image of Beethoven that would have a lasting influence on the Chinese reception of the composer in the following generations, particularly in terms of the construction of Beethoven's myth in China. However, Li's charcoal portrait is strikingly different from many Western portraits of Beethoven. As explained below, a Beethoven myth rooted in the Chinese social and cultural context was continually enriched by subsequent Chinese articulators, ranging from subsequent painters to educators and poets. Additionally, the Beethoven of myth in China is equipped with traits commonly associated with traditional Chinese mythological figures. The reception of Beethoven in China has been covered by Chinese scholars, such as Jindong Cai and Xinyue Zhang, among others. However, existing scholarship focuses mainly on the use of reception theory to analyse Beethoven's reception history in China, or on the exploration of the changing image of Beethoven in China under the influence of politics.<sup>1</sup> Less explored, however, is how the Chinese reception of Beethoven might be understood through the lens of mythmaking. Additionally, Li's portrait of Beethoven, being an important resource for understanding Beethoven's myth in the Global West, is ignored in the existing literature. This paper aims to explore the construction of the Beethoven myth in China in relation to the surrounding social and cultural contexts. After discussing traditional Chinese myth in relation to the making of Beethoven's mythmaking, this paper will analyse several significant Chinese portraits of Beethoven that have a significant influence on the Chinese reception of the composer, comparing them with well-known European portraits of Beethoven, to see the construction of the Chinese Beethoven myth.

---

<sup>1</sup> See, for example, Yuexin Zhang, "Several questions about the history of Beethoven's reception in China," *Journal of the Central Conservatory of Music*, no.2 (2011) and "On the history of Beethoven's reception in China," *Music Research* 43, no.3 (2007).

### **Mythmaking and Beethoven's Myth in Europe and China**

As Alessandra Comini explains, 'mythmaking is as old as civilisation. The need for myth—that recasting of figures and events into archetypes and epics—has characterised all peoples and societies.'<sup>2</sup> Mythmaking has indeed long been an important component of Chinese culture. According to Ke Yuan, one of the three main types of traditional Chinese myths is the legendary heroic figure without magical powers.<sup>3</sup> As Yuan pointed out, these heroic figures all have a common attribute: the endurance of self-imposed hardships in order to strengthen and prepare themselves for achieving their ambitions. This attribute closely resonates with traditional Chinese culture, in which the notions of endurance and eventual triumph are regarded as praiseworthy and crucial for people who are to make groundbreaking achievements.<sup>4</sup> This emphasis on the self-imposed hardships of the heroic figure is also reflected in Western heroic mythmaking. In Europe, the hero of myth, like Beethoven, also 'often displays unusual power of self-assertion against gigantic odds, which then, whether frustrated or victorious, are subsumed into universal meaning.'<sup>5</sup> In addition to these attributes emphasised by the West, the Chinese, enormously influenced by Confucianism, also emphasise virtue and endeavour as two indispensable qualities or even prerequisites for a hero and role model. Therefore, Chinese heroic figures are generally virtuous, diligent and, painstaking. Importantly, as Binghua Tian states, positive and inspiring heroic figures can also give the people

---

<sup>2</sup> Alessandra Comini, *The Changing Image of Beethoven: A Study in Mythmaking* (Sunstone Press, 2008), 10.

<sup>3</sup> Ke Yuan, *Ancient Chinese Mythology* (Chengdu: Ba Shu Press, 1993), 50.

<sup>4</sup> According to Mencius, 'Thus, when Heaven is about to confer a great office on any man, it first exercises his mind with suffering, and his sinews and bones with toil. It exposes his body to hunger, and subjects him to extreme poverty. It confounds his undertakings. By all these methods it stimulates his mind, hardens his nature, and supplies his incompetencies' (James Legge, *The Works of Mencius* (Dover Publications, 2003), 75).

<sup>5</sup> Comini, *The Changing Image of Beethoven*, 14.

hope.<sup>6</sup> Beethoven's image in China fits with these Chinese traits, which will be analysed in detail in the following section.

Regarding the myth of Beethoven, as Comini points out, the composer's image changes in relation to different cultures and is inherited, embellished, or redefined according to the interests and needs of each articulator who contributed to the dissemination and construction of Beethoven's myth.<sup>7</sup> Therefore, mythmaking is not simply passed down unchanged from generation to generation; rather, it is a continuous process of recreation. For example, according to Scott G. Burnham, in the early Western reception, Beethoven's late works were regularly considered to be the symptoms of illness, while later generations prefer to understand them as the highest testimony to his genius.<sup>8</sup> Additionally, his acute physical discomfort, which resulted from the claustrophobic apprehension of near suffocation during the making process of the life mask<sup>9</sup> portrayed by Franz Klein finally evolved into the melancholy of the soul by subsequent mythmakers and music interpreters such as Hector Berlioz and Gustav Mahler. A similar development is also observed in the construction of the Beethoven image in China.

Based on Chinese unique traditional culture and social context, the Beethoven myth in China is different from that in the West. Li's introduction of Beethoven to the Chinese was actually the origin of the Beethoven myth in China; afterwards, Chinese articulators ranging from painters to educators and poets built upon this construction of the Beethoven myth. The Beethoven myth in the West was not introduced to China unaltered. Rather, it was, on the one hand, modified and adapted by Chinese articulators based on their own

---

<sup>6</sup> Binghua Tian, "Listening in Different Cultural and Historical Contexts: Beethoven's Ninth Symphony in China," *Journal of Tianjin Conservatory of Music*, no.2 (2018): 65.

<sup>7</sup> Comini, *The Changing Image of Beethoven*, 10.

<sup>8</sup> Scott Burnham, "Posthumous influence and reception," *Grove Music Online*, accessed April 10, 2020, <https://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000040026#omo-9781561592630-e-0000040026-div1-0000040026.19>.

<sup>9</sup> Anton Felix Schindler, *Beethoven As I Knew Him*, ed. Donald W. MacArdle, trans. Constance S. Jolly (New York, 1972), 455.

interpretations, explanations, and expectations, and, on the other hand, influenced by the Chinese cultural and political background.

### **Analysis of portraits**

Researchers such as Comini and Rita Steblin have analysed the visual arts related to Beethoven to explore the reception and myth of the composer, suggesting that it is crucial to understand the reception of Beethoven through the lens of iconography. In this light, the analysis of representative Chinese portraits of Beethoven is similarly important in terms of understanding the reception of Beethoven’s image and myth in China. The first item through which the Chinese encountered Beethoven appears to be Li’s charcoal drawing,<sup>10</sup> published in *Little Magazine of Music*. Importantly, this drawing was accompanied by a short biographical article of the composer, also written by Li. The Beethoven myth in China was based on this combination, and it is important to understand the charcoal portrait of Beethoven in parallel with the content of the short article.

It is immediately apparent from the article’s title, ‘the Sage of Music,’ that Beethoven is portrayed as a sage-like figure, or ‘some sort of modern, musical Confucian’, in Li’s words. In this short, albeit revealing, article of merely three hundred Chinese words, Li praised the ‘favourable’ personality of Beethoven after giving a brief summary of Beethoven’s tragic life. According to Li, in contrast to the lively character of Mozart, Beethoven was a gloomy person who rarely smiled or socialised. However, Li continued, he had a genuine, contemplative, and diligent personality. Li deeply admired Beethoven’s rigorous attitude towards music creation and his powerful spirit of enduring hardships and struggling for ultimate success. Yet, as pointed out by Jingdong Cai, in order to build a perfectly positive image of Beethoven to encourage Chinese readers, Li carefully filtered out Beethoven’s negative characteristics, such as the ‘composer’s stormy [and thus un-Confucian] relationship with his

---

<sup>10</sup> The picture is presented in “Beethoven’s portrait by Shutong Li,” *Hangzhou Normal University*, accessed July 1, 2020, <https://ysjy.hznu.edu.cn/c/2010-05-17/278321.shtml>.

alcoholic father'.<sup>11</sup> In this way, 'the Chinese fell in love with the image of this person who went through turmoil, obstacles, difficulties [who] at the end, was triumphant'.<sup>12</sup>

Printed on the first page of the magazine, Li's charcoal portrait displays the composer's positive image described in the article. While many scholars have pointed out that the short biographical article of Beethoven is based on Ishikura Kosaburō's *Seiyō ongakushi* (*A History of Western Music*, 1905),<sup>13</sup> it is not clear whether this painting was based on Li's imagination or other portraits of Beethoven. Comparing this drawing with another of Li's charcoal drawings sheds some light on this question. Li learned charcoal drawing when he was studying in Japan and only created two such drawings throughout his life, namely *Beethoven* (1906)<sup>14</sup> and *Head of a Girl* (1906)<sup>15</sup>. Apparently, the styles of the two pieces are drastically different. *Head of a Girl* is a realistic painting that features subtle facial features, expressions, and even emotions of the female figure. By contrast, the portrait of Beethoven is highly abstract: Li only used simple lines to draw the facial features and contour of Beethoven's head. Actually, *Head of a Girl* is close to his overall painting style—realist style—as shown in his other paintings. He seldom created such abstract portraits as *Beethoven*. Furthermore, there is little resemblance between Li's charcoal drawing of Beethoven and other well-known visual depictions of the composer. If the drawing was a replica of another traditional European Beethoven portrait, it would have been closer to its original. Therefore, Li's portrait is more likely a work based on the painter's imagination of Beethoven rather than a reinterpretation of earlier Beethoven portraits. Presumably, this portrait of Beethoven reflects Li's own

---

<sup>11</sup> Jindong Cai and Sheila Melvin, *Beethoven in China, How the Great Composer Became an Icon in the People's Republic* (Australia: Penguin Group, 2015), 6.

<sup>12</sup> "Beethoven: An Unlikely Hero in China," *Cable News Network*, accessed December 1, 2019, <https://edition.cnn.com/2015/11/29/asia/china-beethoven/index.html>.

<sup>13</sup> It was pointed out by Zhongming Zhao, Yue Xing, Binghua Tian, and so forth.

<sup>14</sup> The picture is presented in "Beethoven's portrait by Shutong Li," *Hangzhou Normal University*, accessed July 1, 2020, <https://ysjy.hznu.edu.cn/c/2010-05-17/278321.shtml>.

<sup>15</sup> The picture is presented in Yishu Hong and Zongyu Xia, *Master Hongyi's Legacy* (Huaxia Publishing House, 1987), 51.

understanding and expectations; it might even intentionally carry certain meanings or missions assigned by Li.

Reading Li's charcoal drawing in detail, the almost frizzy appearance of Beethoven's hair is particularly noticeable. Although the hairstyle broadly matches the general descriptions of Beethoven's hair, such as shaggy, electrified, flying,<sup>16</sup> it is still quite different from the soft curly locks of the other well-known Beethoven portraits, such as those of Joseph Karl Stieler<sup>17</sup> and Ferdinand Georg Waldmüller<sup>18</sup>. The shaggy but tough hair in Li's portrait shows a high-spirited, energetic, and militant Beethoven. The shape of the hair—extending towards the left with the hair on the right covering the upper right part of the face, including the right eyebrow and the right eye—looks as though he is confronting strong winds. Importantly, although Li only drew a single horizontal line with slightly irregular curves as Beethoven's mouth and a little dot below the line as the shadow of the lower lip, it abstractly shows the tightly pressed and downward pulling lips of the traditional Beethoven image, giving a sense of seriousness. In addition, in Li's drawing, Beethoven's eyes resemble those of the stereotypical Asian rather than deep-set Caucasian European eyes. In contrast to the Beethoven portraits by Stieler and Waldmüller, in which the sitter's feelings of anger and discontent are highlighted by his restless rolling eyes, Li's Beethoven stares firmly straight ahead. This determined stare characterises Beethoven as an intrepid, daring, and strong-willed hero.

---

<sup>16</sup> Much more detail could be found in Comini, "The Visual Beethoven: Whence, Why, and Whither the Scowl?" in *The Beethoven and His World*, edited by Reinhold Brinkmann (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2000).

<sup>17</sup> The image (*Portrait of Beethoven*, Joseph Karl Stieler, 1819) is presented in Alessandra Comini. "The Visual Beethoven: Whence, Why, and Whither the Scowl?" in *The Beethoven and His World*, edited by Reinhold Brinkmann, (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2000), 292.

<sup>18</sup> The image (*Beethoven*, Ferdinand Georg Waldmüller, 1823) is presented in Alessandra Comini. "The Visual Beethoven: Whence, Why, and Whither the Scowl?" in *The Beethoven and His World*, edited by Reinhold Brinkmann, (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2000), 295.



In spite of this intrepidity, Li's Beethoven looks peaceful and calm, because some of the representative traits that make Beethoven look angry and moody in traditional European portraits are not emphasised in Li's drawing. Typically in European portraits, apart from the relatively plump and rounded contour line of Beethoven's face, his jawline is slightly emphasised, faintly echoing the typical muscular chin highlighted in the traditional image of Beethoven. This muscular chin and its pronounced cleft—the main characteristics of Klein's life mask and other traditional European printed, painted, and sculpted images of the composer—contribute to a habitual 'stern' look and 'leonine images', which are common in the European portraits.<sup>19</sup> However, these features were not emphasised by Li, and therefore, the Beethoven of his portrait looks earnest and calm rather than discontent and angry as the furrowed forehead and the contracted brows are not emphasised in Li's charcoal drawing. The vibrantly bushy arched eyebrows shown by Klein, Stieler, and Waldmüller were similarly recast as a pair of thick, rounded eyebrows by Li, and this also shows Beethoven as a relatively peaceful person. The iconographical analysis of Li's charcoal portrait and the analysis of the short article thus show that the Beethoven created by Li is the perfect sagely hero with a relatively peaceful, calm, and diligent personality and determined eyes.

The reception of Beethoven in China generally emphasises that he was an individual who possessed a persistent spirit and conscientious attitude and also painstakingly sought perfection in his music. It is worth mentioning that this conscientiousness, while an important personality trait in traditional Chinese education, was never highlighted in the Western reception of Beethoven. This type of mythmaking was largely influenced by Chinese society on the one hand and traditional Chinese culture on the other hand. At the beginning of the twentieth century, a series of external and internal crises made China fall into a dark period in its history. The huge loss

---

<sup>19</sup> Comini, "The Visual Beethoven: Whence, Why, and Whither the Scowl?" 291.

of wealth and many unequal treaties<sup>20</sup> signed in the wake of series of wars, ranging from the First Anglo-Chinese War of 1840 to the Siege of the International Legations in 1900, inevitably reduced China to a semi-colonial and semi-feudal society. In order to save China, many Chinese patriots and intellectuals committed themselves to study from the West, especially in the arts and technology. As an enthusiastic patriot, Li stated that music is capable of exerting favourable influences on people's spirit and thoughts, while it can also be used to protect and facilitate the development of a society.<sup>21</sup> Therefore, Li launched the *Little Magazine of Music*, which was not only a platform for him to introduce Western musical knowledge to the Chinese, but also as a tool to propagandise the idea of saving and revitalising the country.<sup>22</sup> As stated by Baoyu Yan, Li was inclined to use Beethoven's earnest spirit and rigorous attitude toward musical creation to encourage himself as well as his fellow Chinese musicians.<sup>23</sup>

After Li, portraits of Beethoven started to appear in China more frequently. In 1913, a new portrait of Beethoven created by Li's student, Hongliang Li was published in another substantial Chinese music magazine, *BaiYang*,<sup>24</sup> with only the caption 'the greatest musician in modern Germany' and the birth and death dates of Beethoven. This print is a copy of Stieler's portrait, in which Beethoven is painted at half-length in a grape arbour, his pencil poised mid-air above the score of *Missa Solemnis*. It replicates the important features of the Stieler portrait, including the arched eyebrows and the electrified hair, but the thick sheaf of scores held in the composer's

---

<sup>20</sup> Unequal treaty is the name given by the Chinese to a series of treaties signed with Western powers during the 19th and early 20th centuries by Qing dynasty China after suffering military defeat by the West or when there was a threat of military action by those powers. For example, *Treaty of Nanking* (1842) and *Treaty of Shimonoseki* (1895)

<sup>21</sup> Baoyu Yan, "On the history of Beethoven's reception in China," *Music Research* 43, no.3 (2007): 43.

<sup>22</sup> Suhhsing Lin, "Li Shutong and the Evolution of Graphic Arts in China," *East Asia Journal* 2, no.1(2007): 90.

<sup>23</sup> Yan, "On the history of Beethoven's reception in China," 46.

<sup>24</sup> This picture (*Beethoven*, Hongliang Li, 1913) could be found in an old Chinese music magazine *BaiYang*.

hand was changed to a small booklet without a cover. It again shows that the Chinese were concerned with the image of Beethoven more than with his music. Due to the idea of 'self-cultivation' in traditional Chinese culture, Chinese intellectuals emphasised the direct influence of the personality of the creator on the works and tended to judge the quality of artwork based on the morality of the creator and the subject.<sup>25</sup> Hongliang Li therefore tended to prioritise the composer's personality and tragic life experience over the actual listening experience of the music. The Chinese painter Beihong Xu, on the other hand, portrayed Beethoven's mask from three angles<sup>26</sup>, depicting the mask in great detail, similar to the original life mask created by Klein. Xu made the drawing when he was studying in France and titled it 'The Painting Dedicated to Beethoven by Beihong Xu in 1922', showing his respect for the composer. In bringing a more 'real' image of Beethoven to the Chinese, both these pictures updated and expanded the public's knowledge and understanding of Beethoven brought by Li. The Beethoven myth created by Li thus lived on in the Chinese consciousness.

## Conclusion

In conclusion, just as Comini argues that mythmaking is a process of recreation, the traditional Beethoven myth in the West went through a process of transformation and recreation in China ever since Li introduced Beethoven through his charcoal drawing and short article. Rooted in Chinese culture and social context, the Beethoven myth created in China is similar to the Chinese myths of heroic figures. The Beethoven created by Li is the perfect sage and a brave, daring, and strong-willed hero who achieved success through his perpetual suffering. Li's emphasis on Beethoven's virtues and diligent personality is consistent with the traits of the heroic figures in Chinese traditional myth, regarded as two crucial personalities of heroes in Confucian Chinese culture. The Beethoven myth served Li's social

---

<sup>25</sup> Ibid., 43.

<sup>26</sup> The picture (*Beethoven mask*, Beihong Xu, 1922) can be found in an old Chinese music magazine BaiYang.

purpose and influenced the Chinese for a long period. Two later Beethoven portraits subtly inflected but did not change the Beethoven image and myth established by Li. In China, rather than the music of Beethoven, the *personality* of Beethoven appears to have been more important for the Chinese to adore the musical titan. He was the role model not only for artists but also for wider society. Beethoven, just like a traditional heroic figure in Chinese myth, gave the Chinese strength and hope.

## Bibliography

- "Beethoven: An Unlikely Hero in China", Cable News Network, accessed December 1, 2019.  
<https://edition.cnn.com/2015/11/29/asia/china-beethoven/index.html>.
- Burnham, Scott. "Posthumous influence and reception." *Grove Music Online*, accessed April 10, 2020.  
<https://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000040026#omo-9781561592630-e-0000040026-div1-0000040026.19>.
- Cai, Jindong, and Sheila Melvin. *Beethoven in China, How the Great Composer Became an Icon in the People's Republic*. Australia: Penguin Group, 2015.
- Comini, Alessandra. "The Visual Beethoven: Whence, Why, and Whither the Scowl?" In *the Beethoven and His World*, edited by Reinhold Brinkmann, 287–312. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2000.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *The Changing Image of Beethoven: A Study in Mythmaking*. Sunstone Press, 2008.
- Jiang, Qing. "A Conversation about the Western Music and Art Works." In *Infinite Beauty in the Dangerous Mountain Peak*. Beijing: People's Publishing House, 1968.
- Fu, Lei. *The Complete Works of Fu Lei*. Shenyang: Liaoning Education Press, 2002.
- Legge, James. *The Works of Mencius*. Dover Publications, 2003.
- Liao, Fushu, "Beethoven in China." *Music Research*, no.3 (1992): 96–8.
- Lin, Suhhsing, "Li Shutong and the Evolution of Graphic Arts in China", *East Asia Journal* 2, no.1(2007): 90.
- Lu, Xun. "The History of Science." in *The Complete Works of Lu Xun*. Beijing: People's literature Publishing House, 1981.
- Qian, Liqun, "Why we should read masterpieces?" *Basic Education*, no.12 (2006): 36–7.
- Schindler, Anton Felix. *Beethoven As I Knew Him*. Translated by Constance S. Jolly. New York, 1972
- 'The Original Text of The Music Giant Beethoven.' *Yuwen*, accessed

- April 5, 2020. <https://yuwen.chazidian.com/xiangxi-272730/>.
- Tian, Binghua, "Listening in Different Cultural and Historical Contexts: Beethoven's Ninth Symphony in China." *Journal of Tianjin Conservatory of Music*, no.2 (2018): 64–75.
- Yan, Baoyu, "On the history of Beethoven's reception in China." *Music Research* 43, no.3 (2007): 43–55.
- Zhang, Yuexin. "Several questions about the history of Beethoven's reception in China", *Journal of the Central Conservatory of Music*, no.2 (2011): 15.
- Zhao, Zhongming, "The History of the Text and the Textual Nature of the History -- a review on the study of Beethoven's biography in the Chinese context." *Journal of the Central Conservatory of Music*, no.2 (2007): 56–64.

## Marvel and Disguise

### *Fantastic Musical Instruments in Italian Late Renaissance Theatre Performances*

*Arianna Rigamonti*

#### Abstract

In Renaissance Italian performances, it was not difficult to encounter disparate fantastic musical instruments. The term ‘fantastic’ refers to fabulous, bizarre, disguised, zoomorphically-shaped and imaginary instruments designed for the stage. Through historic descriptions of instruments, iconographies, and existing musical instruments, this paper will present an overview of these fabulous objects, focusing on their role and symbolism within the Italian theatrical culture of the sixteenth century.

Lutes concealed in shells, flutes resembling fish backbones, viols disguised as swans, serpent-bows, barrel hoops as harps: these are just some examples of camouflaged musical instruments used in Florentine *intermedi* (from 1518 to ca. 1600). Starting from *intermedi*, the investigation broadens into other types of Italian performance with masked characters, such as *sacre rappresentazioni*, *miracoli*, festivals, masquerade and parades. The presentation will be a journey through musical instruments designed for different scenographies: from celestial to infernal instruments, from the sea to the meadow.

Little has been written regarding fantastic musical instruments and their association with scenography, characters, and represented stories. However, they reflect the Renaissance search for spectacularity and the natural disposition to visual enjoyment for the nobility at the time. This paper will explore whether the look and beauty of these instruments were more important than their musical function and sound quality. Might the disguise and concealment of musical

instruments be an attempt to hide the source from which the music came?

### **Biography**

**Arianna Rigamonti** is an early career researcher in organology. She completed two internships working with historical musical instrument collections: at St Cecilia’s Hall in Edinburgh and at the Rijksmuseum in Amsterdam. She holds a master’s degree in musicology from the Department of Musicology and Cultural Heritage in Cremona of the University of Pavia and a violin diploma from the Gaetano Donizetti Conservatory of Bergamo. She is currently a PhD candidate in Material Culture and Music at the Royal College of Music, London, as a RCM Studentship holder.

**Keywords:** Musical instruments, Fantastic, Marvel, Disguise, Intermedi

**Affiliation:** Royal College of Music, London, United Kingdom

**Email:** arianna.rigamonti@rcm.ac.uk



In Italian Renaissance theatre, the marvel was a fundamental ingredient of performances. The disguise, the appearance and the uncertainty of reality became the protagonists of the show, with a lot of hidden significances and mythological emblems. Actors dressed in sumptuous costumes, handling refined props and moving through a majestic scenography led the audience into another world, far from reality and, most of the time, inside ancient myths. In this fabulous context, it was possible to find fantastic musical instruments: wondrous, bizarre, disguised and zoomorphically-shaped instruments were shown and played during the performances. Some of these items could have lost their functional or acoustical requirements, others could have retained their musical function and simply been adapted to the circumstances they were built for. This paper is based on my Master's thesis and represents the starting point of broader research on fantastic musical instruments as cultural objects within late Renaissance Italy, which is the subject of my PhD research, still at an early stage.

Sixteenth-century Italian courts and, most of all, the Medici Court in Florence, used to celebrate dynastic weddings, baptisms of progeny and official coronations with elaborate festivals. They were magnificent performances with triumphal processions, including pageant-wagons, competitions, theatrical plays with musical *intermedi*,<sup>1</sup> balls, masquerades and banquets. Such official occasions were usually accompanied by the commissioning of luxurious volumes to commemorate the splendour of the celebrations: these so-called *festival books* served as court propaganda, as well as memorials, and are fundamental primary sources because of the details of the events they report.<sup>2</sup> Within some of the festival books, it is possible to

---

<sup>1</sup> *Intermedi* were musical and dramatic entertainments inserted between the acts of plays in the Renaissance and Baroque periods. At their beginning stage, only instrumental music was played out of sight of the audience (*intermedi non apparenti* or 'invisible'). However, the 'visible' type was more popular and showed costumed singers, actors and dancers who performed a mythological story (*intermedi apparenti*).

<sup>2</sup> For information about festival books, see Edmund Addison Bowles, "Music in Court Festivals of State: Festival Books as Sources for Performance Practices," *Early Music* 28, no. 3 (2000): 421–43 and *Musical ensembles in festival books, 1500-1800: An*

read descriptions of the musical instruments played in such occasions, among which there are some fantastic examples. Historical descriptions of these fabulous instruments, such as the ones in the festival books, iconographies from that time and existing historical musical instruments are combined and compared to present an overview of the phenomenon of fantastic musical instruments in Italian theatrical performances and to understand their role and symbolism within the musical practice of the sixteenth century.

The painting *The Liberation of Andromeda* by Piero Di Cosimo (1510-15) is particularly significant to delineate this phenomenon (see Fig. 1a). The depicted story comes from the *Metamorphoses* by Ovid and illustrates the liberation of Andromeda, trapped by a sea monster sent by Poseidon to punish the vanity of Cassiopeia, Andromeda’s mother, who prided herself on being the most beautiful nymph in the sea. In the top right-hand side corner of the painting, the hero Perseus descends from the sky, as a *deus ex machina*, and bravely fights against the fairytale-like monster (in the middle), while Andromeda’s parents and other stricken spectators are watching the scene (left side). On the right, jubilant people are celebrating Andromeda’s liberation, dancing to the music played by two musicians with bizarre musical instruments (see Fig. 1b). The one on the left is portrayed in the act of tuning his three-string instrument with a long neck and a small sound box which ends with a decorative sculpture resembling a swan head. Despite its fantastic shape, this instrument might be actually functional and playable. By contrast, the other instrument, played by a dark-skinned musician, is a composite instrument, formed by a big sound box with seven strings and a wind attachment in a shape of a bird head, which appears to be functionally nonsense. In fact, the fingerholes are in a curious position: they are not between the blow-pipe and the bell of the tube as expected; hence, it is impossible to

---

*iconographical & documentary survey* (Ann Arbor, London: UMI Research Press, 1989); Helen Watanabe-O’Kelly and Anne Simon, *Festivals and Ceremonies: A Bibliography of Works Relating to Court, Civic, and Religious Festivals in Europe 1500-1800* (New York: Mansell, 1999). See also the *Early Modern Festival Books Database*, which is an updated survey of festival books carried out by the University of Oxford: <http://festivals.mml.ox.ac.uk> [Accessed August 18, 2020].

change the pitch of the sound.<sup>3</sup> The narrative layout of the painting and the scenic disposition of the characters, dressed up as if they were actors on the stage, show Di Cosimo's experience as an artist working for the Medici court festivals.<sup>4</sup> Even the two fantastic instruments seem to have been modelled after existing instruments, for which the evident occasion might have been the theatrical performances during the court festivals.

Sixteenth-century dramatic subjects fell easily into categories and musical instruments followed suit in this division: the *pastoral ensemble* featured recorders and bagpipes characterizing rural life; seascapes with generally the transverse flute as the dominant timbre; the *infernal ensemble* with trombones, cornetts, regals, bassoons and bass viol illustrated the underworld and the realm of the dragons and the devil; and the *celestial ensemble* featured lutes, viols and flutes, illustrating the realm of the heavens.<sup>5</sup> Examples of fantastic musical instruments can be found in each of these categories.

---

<sup>3</sup> Emanuel Winternitz, "Musical Instruments for the Stage in Paintings by Filippino Lippi, Piero Di Cosimo, and Lorenzo Costa," in *Musical Instruments and Their Symbolism in Western Art: Studies in Musical Iconology*, ed. by Emanuel Winternitz (New Haven, London: Yale University Press, 1979), 211–25 (pp. 214–5).

<sup>4</sup> Giorgio Vasari reports Piero Di Cosimo's contribution for the celebrations at the Florentine court in 1512 for the Medici family return to Florence after eighteen years in exile. The artist collaborated for the design of the masquerade and the triumphal parade of beautifully decorated pageant-wagons. See: Giorgio Vasari, *Vite de' più eccellenti pittori, scultori ed architettori*, ed. by Gaetano Milanesi (Firenze: Sansoni Editore, 1882), Volume 4: 134–5.

<sup>5</sup> Robert L. Weaver, "Sixteenth-Century Instrumentation," *The Musical Quarterly* 47, no. 3 (1961): 363–78.



Figure 7.1a: Piero Di Cosimo, *The Liberation of Andromeda*, 1510-15, 70x120 cm. Collection: Firenze, Uffizi (inv. no. 1536).



Figure 1b: Detail of fig. 1a – musicians

### Pastoral Instruments

In the pastoral setting, fantastic mythological creatures, such as nymphs, satyrs and fauns, were on the stage together with real characters such as shepherds and peasants, who were removed from their reality to be thrown into the fantastic world of timeless myth. This is the case in two scenes of the *intermedi* of the theatrical play *Il Commodo* by Antonio Landi which was performed in Florence for the wedding of Cosimo I to Eleanor of Toledo in 1539. The first *intermedio*, in between the first and second acts of the comedy, showed twelve shepherds on the stage playing disguised musical instruments and singing a *canzonetta* [song] to the sun. Pier Francesco Giambullari's festival book describes the disguise of their instruments: the shepherds played crumhorns and cornetts concealed behind or inside pastoral elements, such as a leafy fresh cane, a chestnut branch, a deer shank and goat horns.<sup>6</sup> Similar camouflages were also in the sixth *intermedio* of the same comedy, where twenty bacchantes, ten women and ten satyrs, sang and played on the scene. Giambullari described some of the played instruments with the following words:

A wineskin dressed a drum, accompanied by a *zufolo*  
[pastoral recorder] concealed in a human thighbone.  
A small rebec was hidden behind a deer's head.  
A goat horn served as a cornett and a crane-bone as  
a crumhorn.  
A *tromba torta* [trombone] resembled a grapevine and  
a barrel hoop with rushes became a harp.<sup>7</sup>

From most of these instruments, it is difficult to imagine what they looked like and what sound they made. Were they only common

---

<sup>6</sup> Pier Francesco Giambullari, *Apparato e feste nelle nozze dello illustrissimo signor duca di Firenze [et] della duchessa sua consorte, con le sue stanze, madrigali, comedia, [et] intermedi in quelle recitati* (Firenze, 1539), 90-92. See also Alois Maria Nagler, *Theatre Festivals of the Medici, 1539-1637* (New Haven, London: Yale University Press, 1964) 5-12.

<sup>7</sup> Giambullari, *Apparato e feste nelle nozze dello illustrissimo signor duca di Firenze [et] della duchessa sua consorte*, 169. English translation by the author.

instruments hidden behind other objects, or were they actually made of rushes and bones?

In the painting by Bartolomeo di Giovanni *The Marriage of Teti and Peleo* (ca. 1490-1500) a centaur is playing a lyre with the sound box in the shape of a deer's head.<sup>8</sup> Again, the scenario of the painting is the celebration of a marriage and the bride and the groom are pastoral mythological characters. A similar lyre was painted also by Filippino Lippi in his *Allegory of Music* (ca. 1500): it resembles the ancient Greek *lyra chélyis* that had a tortoise shell as a sound box; in the painting, the deer's head works as a sound box and the horns serve as supports for the golden crossbar to which the strings are attached (see Fig. 2).<sup>9</sup> Examining its representation in the painting, this instrument is certainly not functional, however, it seems very close to the disguise described for the theatrical instruments used on the stage during the performances of the *intermedi*.<sup>10</sup> Moreover, Lippi knew the court festivals very well, as he designed the *Triumph of Peace* on the occasion of the celebration for the triumphal entry of Charles VIII into Florence in November 1494. A last fantastic instrument that needs to be mentioned is the well-known and mysterious skull-lyre drawn by Leonardo Da Vinci:<sup>11</sup> there is no further information about this drawing, but it is renowned that Da Vinci designed numerous stage machines for theatre performances.<sup>12</sup>

---

<sup>8</sup> Bartolomeo di Giovanni, *The marriage of Teti and Peleo*, ca. 1490-1500, 42x150 cm, Paris, Louvre (inv. no. R.F.1346).  
[http://cartelen.louvre.fr/cartelen/visite?srv=car\\_not\\_frame&idNotice=13695](http://cartelen.louvre.fr/cartelen/visite?srv=car_not_frame&idNotice=13695)  
 [Accessed August 18, 2020].

<sup>9</sup> Winternitz, “Musical Instruments for the Stage [...]” 222.

<sup>10</sup> According to Erwin Panofsky, Lippi represented Doride's description of Polyphemus' lyre in the *Marine Dialogues* by Luciano: thus, another instrument played by pastoral mythological characters. See Erwin Panofsky, *Rinascimento e rinascenze nell'arte occidentale* (Milano: Feltrinelli, 1971) 236.

<sup>11</sup> Leonardo Da Vinci, *Codex Ashburnham*, Bibliothèque Nationale de France, Paris, MS. 2037, folio C r.

<sup>12</sup> Winternitz, *Leonardo Da Vinci as a Musician* (New Haven, London: Yale University Press, 1982).





Figure 7.2: Filippino Lippi, *Allegory of Music*, ca. 1500, 62.5x51.8 cm – detail.  
Collection: Berlin, Kaiser Friedrich Museum (inv. no. 78A).

### Marine Instruments

In the Florentine *intermedi* for *Il Commodo* in 1539 (mentioned above), musical instruments disguised with marine elements were played by sea creatures in the second *intermedio*, between the second and third act of the comedy:

Three marine Nymphs had a lute hidden inside a conch shell. [...] Three marine Monsters played a transfigured transverse flute: the first one looked like a long fish backbone, with the head and the tail; the other like a marine snail; and the third one like a reed.<sup>13</sup>

Also in the fifth *intermedio* of *La Pellegrina* by Girolamo Bargagli, that represented the myth of Arion, tritons and nymphs required appropriate masked musical instruments, as Girolamo Seriacopi reported:

Decorate the instruments of the goddess and the nymphs to make them look like sea shells, and do not forget the dolphin. [...] It will be necessary to make the instruments look like sea shells and other things from the sea.<sup>14</sup>

Seriacopi, in his *Memoriale et Ricordi*, described numerous details of the celebration for the wedding of Grand Duke Ferdinand I de' Medici to Christina of Lorraine in Florence in 1589. For that occasion, artists of great reputation participated in the preparation of the celebration which included the well-known six *intermedi* for the comedy *La*

---

<sup>13</sup> Giambullari, *Apparato e feste nelle nozze dello illustrissimo signor duca di Firenze [...]*, 111–2. English translation by the author.

<sup>14</sup> Girolamo Seriacopi, *Memoriale et ricordi*, in *L'officina delle nuvole: il Teatro Mediceo nel 1589 e gli Intermedi de Buontalenti nel Memoriale di Girolamo Seriacopi*, ed. by Annamaria Testaverde Matteini (Milano: Associazione Amici della Scala, 1991), 205, 220. English translation by Winternitz in 'Musical Instruments for the Stage [...]', 220.



*Pellegrina*. In Seriacopi's report are contained, among other information, the technical instructions for each instrument given by Giovanni Bardi, the chief organizer of the event—instructions that were forwarded to the theatre workshop. Some of the instructions read:

Other papier-mâché to cover instruments [...].  
Decorate the instruments of the musicians with  
taffeta and veils.<sup>15</sup>

Stage instruments were sent to the *Guardaroba* [wardrobe]<sup>16</sup> to be dressed up with papier-mâché, veils, taffeta, leaves, or flowers to fit the scenes and their allegorical functions, exactly like the actors with their costumes. Further research is needed to state whether this was the common practice for the musical instruments in *intermedi* or was a specific direction only for the 1589 *intermedi*. However, it represents an extremely important source for performance practice at the time.

In collections of historical musical instruments, it is possible to find a few pieces from the sixteenth century that perfectly match with a theatrical seascape. First of all, two citterns by Girolamo Virchi from Brescia with their back in the shape of a shell,<sup>17</sup> a John Rose *orphanion* that has a beautifully carved shell on its back,<sup>18</sup> and a marvellous rebec by Baptista Bressano in the shape of a dolphin.<sup>19</sup> Also, some wind

---

<sup>15</sup> Seriacopi, *Memoriale et ricordi*, 179, 225. English translation by Winternitz in 'Musical Instruments for the Stage [...]', 219.

<sup>16</sup> The *Guardaroba* was the office responsible for the administration and conservation of the assets owned by the Medici family, as well as for the organisation of court festivals and theatrical representations.

<sup>17</sup> One was built in 1570 and is currently held at the Cité de la Musique in Paris (inv. no. E.1271), the other, built four years later, is part of the collection of the Kunsthistorisches Museum in Wien (inv. no. A61).  
<https://collectionsdumusee.philharmoniedeparis.fr/doc/MUSEE/0160997/cistre;>  
<https://www.khm.at/objektdb/detail/84731/> [Accessed August 18, 2020].

<sup>18</sup> The John Rose *orphanion* was built in Bridewell, London in 1580 and it was owned by Sir Lionel Tollemache from Helmingham and is still held in his old residence, Helmingham Hall in Suffolk.

<sup>19</sup> The rebec in the shape of a dolphin (late 16<sup>th</sup> or early 17<sup>th</sup> century) has a reliable label with the name of Baptista Bressano, probable from Brescia, and now is in

instruments need to be mentioned: two curious double-reed instruments in the shape of marine dragons have been studied by Herbert Heyde (see Fig. 3).<sup>20</sup> The way they used to function is still unknown, however, they appear not suitable to be played by professional musicians because of how roughly they are made, ‘but it was certainly suitable at least for producing some growling sounds and “hellish” noise in, as it seems, underworld scenes. [...] In both dragons we first have to understand their form and symbolism and second the acoustical and musical side.’<sup>21</sup>



Figure 7.3: *Sea Dragon* (Italy, early 17th century). Collection: New York, Metropolitan Museum of Art (inv. no. 89.4.881).

### **Infernal Instruments**

Growling sounds, together with melodies out of tune and fearsome disguises, were elements of the masquerade that took place in Florence

---

exposition at the Museo Internazionale e Biblioteca della Musica in Bologna (inv. no. 1758).

<http://www.bibliotecamusica.it/cmbm/scripts/strumenti/scheda.asp?id=95&path=/cmbm/images/ripro/strumenti/vdm117/> [Accessed August 26, 2020].

<sup>20</sup> They are both Italian from the early 17th century: one is at the Metropolitan Museum of Art in New York (inv. no. 89.4.881) and the other is at the Cincinnati Art Museum in Ohio (inv. no. 1919.301). See: Herbert Heyde, ‘Two European Wind Instruments in the Shape of a Dragon’, *Music in Art* 32, no. 1–2 (2007): 133–41. <https://www.metmuseum.org/art/collection/search/501492>; <https://www.cincinnatiartmuseum.org/art/explore-the-collection?id=11598519> [Accessed August 27, 2020].

<sup>21</sup> Heyde, “Two European Wind Instruments in the Shape of a Dragon,” 139.

on 16 February 1550, as described by Alessandro d'Ancona.<sup>22</sup> Fire, snakes, demons and fear have always been representative of a hellish scenario and were certainly found also in the infernal scenes of *intermedi*, with appropriate masked musical instruments. For example, in the third *intermedio* for the comedy *La Cofanaria* by Francesco d'Ambra, performed in Florence in 1565 for the wedding of Francesco de' Medici to Joanna of Austria, we find the characters Deceits that sang a madrigal and 'carried traps, fish hooks, or deceptive hooks under which were hidden, with singular ingenuity, curved pipes [crumhorns] for the music they were supposed to produce.'<sup>23</sup> The fifth *intermedio* for the same play included a more complex disguise: to defend themselves against horrifying serpents, four allegorical characters grasped four snakes, within which excellent viols were cleverly hidden.<sup>24</sup> Musical instruments posing as snakes are found also in the fourth *intermedio* for the above-mentioned *La Pellegrina* (Florence, 1589):

Signor Bernardo [Buontalenti] says to give to the keeper of costumes the designs of the four viols that look like serpents. [...] Wrapping of taffeta around the trombones to make them look like serpents is the duty of the keeper of the costumes. [...] Four *violoni* [bass viols] should be covered with taffeta painted green, and scales, and gilded to look like serpents.<sup>25</sup>

It must have been an extraordinary show for the audience, which would never have expected the music to come from snakes or other objects of hellish camouflage.

---

<sup>22</sup> Alessandro d'Ancona, *Origini del teatro italiano* (Torino: Loescher, 1891), 273.

<sup>23</sup> Antonio Francesco Grazzini (known as 'Il Lasca'), *Descrizione degl'intermedi rappresentati con la commedia nelle nozze dell'Illustrissimo, ed Eccellentissimo Signor Principe di Firenze, e di Siena* (Firenze, 1593), 11. English translation by Winternitz in 'Musical Instruments for the Stage [...]', 217.

<sup>24</sup> Grazzini, *Descrizione degl'intermedi rappresentati [...]*, 14.

<sup>25</sup> Seriacopi, *Memoriale et ricordi*, 205, 227-228. English translation by Winternitz in "Musical Instruments for the Stage [...]," 220.

In collections of historical musical instruments, it is possible to find a few examples of Italian wind instruments, mostly cornetts, dating back to the sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries, in the guise of a snake. The purpose of their design cannot be said with certainty, but it is likely that they were theatrical instruments used in frightening scenes. One such snake cornett can be found in the Accademia Filarmonica in Verona (inv. no. 13290),<sup>26</sup> and several other examples, that include soprano, tenor and bass cornetts, are part of the collection of the Cité de la Musique in Paris: inv. no. E.087;<sup>27</sup> E.149;<sup>28</sup> E.581;<sup>29</sup> E.582;<sup>30</sup> E.955;<sup>31</sup> E.979.2.20;<sup>32</sup> E.980.2.164.<sup>33</sup> At the Kunsthistorisches Museum in Wien, there is a marvellous set of five *tartölten* of German origin and built before 1578 (inv. no. A.219-223).<sup>34</sup> These are double-reed instruments with wooden bodies resembling green and golden little dragons with red tongues; each one has its own size for different pitches. Julius von Schlosser suggested their theatrical function and highlighted their impossibility of playing in tune:<sup>35</sup> the nobility must have had fun while listening to out of tune melodies played by a costumed musician with his little dragon.

<sup>26</sup> John Henry van der Meer, *Catalogo degli strumenti musicali dell'Accademia Filarmonica di Verona*, Verona: Accademia Filarmonica, 1982, 61-62, 122.

<sup>27</sup> <https://collectionsdumusee.philharmoniedeparis.fr/doc/MUSEE/0157526/cornet-a-bouquin-basse> [Accessed August 22, 2020].

<sup>28</sup> <https://collectionsdumusee.philharmoniedeparis.fr/doc/MUSEE/0161107/cornet-a-bouquin-tenor> [Accessed August 22, 2020].

<sup>29</sup> <https://collectionsdumusee.philharmoniedeparis.fr/doc/MUSEE/0161836/cornet-a-bouquin-en-la> [Accessed August 22, 2020].

<sup>30</sup> <https://collectionsdumusee.philharmoniedeparis.fr/doc/MUSEE/0161840/cornet-a-bouquin> [Accessed August 22, 2020].

<sup>31</sup> <https://collectionsdumusee.philharmoniedeparis.fr/doc/MUSEE/0157265/cornet-en-forme-de-serpent> [Accessed August 22, 2020].

<sup>32</sup> <https://collectionsdumusee.philharmoniedeparis.fr/doc/MUSEE/0160847/cornet-a-bouquin-basse> [Accessed August 22, 2020].

<sup>33</sup> <https://collectionsdumusee.philharmoniedeparis.fr/doc/MUSEE/0159628/cornet-a-bouquin-tenor> [Accessed August 22, 2020].

<sup>34</sup> Julius von Schlosser, *Die Sammlung alter Musikinstrumente: beschreibendes Verzeichnis*, Hildesheim: Olms, 1984, 85-87; Winternitz, Lilly Stunzi, *Die schönsten Musikinstrumente des Abendlandes*, 82-3; <https://www.khm.at/de/object/d6dc4f62c3/> [Accessed August 22, 2020].

<sup>35</sup> von Schlosser, *Die Sammlung alter Musikinstrumente: beschreibendes Verzeichnis*, 85-7.

### Celestial Instruments

Protagonists of theatre performances were, above all, divine creatures, mostly mythological. Celestial scenes allowed the audience to see a heavenly world where godly characters, although in human form, had supernatural skills. However, the musical instruments did not always mirror earthly ones and fantastic elements were added to make them suitable to the extraordinary scenario. This is the case, for example, in the second *intermedio* for the comedy *La Cofanaria*. Grazzini, in the festival book written for the occasion, described ‘a little Cupid, who seemed to carry a lovely swan in his arms: in this swan, an excellent viol was hidden, and while the Cupid seemed to caress the swan with a swamp reed for a fiddle bow, it began to produce sweet music.’<sup>36</sup> Other celestial disguises can be found in the first *intermedio* for the above-mentioned *La Pellegrina* (Florence, 1589), entitled *The Harmony of the Spheres*, for which Seriacopi reported:

Decorate the harps, lutes, and other instruments so that they look the same as the celestial rays. [...] Attach to the lutes, harps, and other instruments some ribbons and pieces of papier-mâché or other material to make them look like rays of stars.<sup>37</sup>

Beyond mythological gods, we have to consider also the celestial world of the Christian religion, deeply rooted in the Italian Renaissance culture. Stories from the Bible were common subjects for other kinds of theatrical performances, such as the so-called *sacre rappresentazioni* and *miracoli*, which usually took place inside churches. Here, the domes served often as a symbol of heaven and complex stage machines were built in the shape of clouds to carry angelic characters and musicians. This may well have been the inspiration for the stunning dome of the *Santuario della Beata Vergine dei Miracoli* in

---

<sup>36</sup> Grazzini, *Descrizione degl'intermedi rappresentati [...]*, 9–10. English translation by Winternitz in “Musical Instruments for the Stage [...],” 216.

<sup>37</sup> Seriacopi, *Memoriale et ricordi*, 204, 219. English translation by Winternitz in “Musical Instruments for the Stage [...],” 219.

Saronno, painted by Gaudenzio Ferrari (1535-36): an angelic choir with musicians covers the entire dome, at the centre of which there is a wooden carved figure of God.<sup>38</sup> Some of these angels are playing inventive fantastic musical instruments: the most original one is a bow-wind instrument, a flute that seems to have, as middle joint, a pyriform sound box like the one of a rebec; an instrument with the shape similar to a Pan flute is held as a *viola da braccio* and played with a bow; a dolphin rebec resembles the above-mentioned rebec by Bressano in Bologna.<sup>39</sup> There are also some trumpets with a long sinuous pipes that resemble two beautifully crafted trumpets by Anton Schnitzer from Nuremberg, currently held by the Accademia Filarmonica in Verona and the Kunsthistorisches Museum in Wien.<sup>40</sup>

Regarding the credibility of angelic music depictions, Emanuel Winternitz suggested interesting questions that still have no answers:

Did the painters simply transfer earthly ensembles, profane or ecclesiastical, into the celestial spheres? Or did they expect the angels to be unhampered by the earthly laws of acoustics, to play special celestial instruments, and to perform in groups of ensembles unknown in earthly practice? Were the artists able, then, to follow their unbridled imaginations and to compete with the mystic and poetic interpreters of the Scriptures, filling the heavens with fantastic shapes and other objects never seen on earth?<sup>41</sup>

---

<sup>38</sup> Gabriele Ferrari, Luigi Lazzaroni, Alberto Artioli, Andrea Di Lorenzo, Sandro Boccardi, *Il concerto degli angeli: Gaudenzio Ferrari e la cupola del santuario di Saronno*, Cinisello Balsamo: Pizzi, 1990.

<sup>39</sup> See footnote 123.

<sup>40</sup> The Schnitzer trumpet in Verona is dated 1585 (inv. no. 13.303). See: John Henry van der Meer, *Catalogo degli strumenti musicali dell'Accademia Filarmonica di Verona*, 66-70, 126-127. The other Schnitzer trumpet in Wien was built in 1598 (inv. no. 181). See Emanuel Winternitz and Lilly Stunzi, *Die schönsten Musikinstrumente des Abendlandes* (München: Keyserische Verlagbrchhandlung, 1966), 106-7.

<sup>41</sup> Winternitz, 'Secular Musical Practice in Sacred Art', *Early Music* 3, no. 3 (1975): 220-6 (p. 221).

## Conclusions

Disguising a musical instrument with veils, papier-mâché or other kind of objects must have made the performances even more spectacular for the audience. In the historical descriptions of the instruments' disguises, the expression 'hidden behind' is often used. It is not possible to define it with certainty, but it can be assumed that the camouflage was an efficient way to hide the sources from which the music came. At that time, the idea of listening to music without the visible presence of musicians playing their instruments was itself a fantastical effect, in a way that modern audiences cannot easily imagine. Hence, the result was a heightened sense of spectacular otherworldly fantasy.

However, was the sound of these instruments that extraordinary? Surely, the camouflage negatively influenced the sound quality, dampening the power of the sound. It seems evident that the look and beauty of the instruments onstage were more important than their actual sound. They were considered part of the majestic scenography of this kind of celebration, and the musicians, who played them, became actors. As a matter of fact, the aesthetics of the marvellous in theatrical performances reflects the predisposition of the Renaissance nobility to visual pleasure; musical instruments could do nothing but respond to this need, especially when, from a stage, they had to inspire amazement and wonder.

## Bibliography

- d’Ancona, Alessandro. *Origini del teatro italiano*. Torino: Loescher, 1891.
- Bowles, Edmund Addison. “Music in Court Festivals of State: Festival Books as Sources for Performance Practices.” *Early Music* 28, no. 3 (2000): 421–43.
- . *Musical Ensembles in Festival Books, 1500-1800: An Iconographical & Documentary Survey*. Ann Arbor, London: UMI Research Press, 1989.
- Brown, Howard Mayer. *Sixteenth-Century Instrumentation: The Music for the Florentine Intermedii*. American Institute of Musicology, 1973.
- Falletti, Franca, Renato Meucci, and Gabriele Rossi-Rognoni ed. *Marvels of sound and beauty: Italian Baroque musical instruments*. Florence: Giunti, 2007.
- Ferrari, Gabriele, Luigi Lazzaroni, Alberto Artioli, Andrea Di Lorenzo, and Sandro Boccardi, *Il concerto degli angeli: Gaudenzio Ferrari e la cupola del santuario di Saronno*, Cinisello Balsamo: Pizzi, 1990.
- Giambullari, Pier Francesco. *Apparato e feste nelle nozze dello illustrissimo signor duca di Firenze [et] della duchessa sua consorte, con le sue stanze, madrigali, comedia, [et] intermedij in quelle recitati*. Firenze, 1539.
- Grazzini, Antonio Francesco. *Descrizione degl’intermedi rappresentati con la commedia nelle nozze dell’Illustrissimo, ed Eccellentissimo Signor Principe di Firenze, e di Siena*. Firenze, 1593.
- Heyde, Herbert. “Two European Wind Instruments in the Shape of a Dragon.” *Music in Art* 32, no. 1–2 (2007): 133–41.
- Meer, John Henry van der. *Catalogo degli strumenti musicali dell’Accademia Filarmonica di Verona*. Verona: Accademia Filarmonica, 1982.
- Nagler, Alois Maria. *Theatre Festivals of the Medici, 1539-1637*. New Haven, London: Yale University Press, 1964.
- Panofsky, Erwin. *Rinascimento e rinascenze nell’arte occidentale*. Milano: Feltrinelli, 1971.
- von Schlosser, Julius. *Die Sammlung alter Musikinstrumente: beschreibendes Verzeichnis*. Hildesheim: Olms, 1984.



- Seriacopi, Girolamo. *Memoriale et ricordi*, in *L'officina delle nuvole: il Teatro Mediceo nel 1589 e gli Intermedi de Buontalenti nel Memoriale di Girolamo Seriacopi*, edited by Matteini, Annamaria Testaverde. Milano: Associazione Amici della Scala, 1991.
- Vasari, Giorgio. *Vite de' più eccellenti pittori, scultori ed architettori*, edited by Milanesi, Gaetano. Firenze: Sansoni Editore, 1882. Vol. 4, 134–5.
- Watanabe-O'Kelly, Helen, and Anne Simon, *Festivals and Ceremonies: A Bibliography of Works Relating to Court, Civic, and Religious Festivals in Europe 1500-1800*. New York: Mansell, 1999.
- Weaver, Robert L. "Sixteenth-Century Instrumentation." *The Musical Quarterly* 47, no. 3 (1961): 363–78.
- Winternitz, Emanuel. *Leonardo Da Vinci as a Musician*. New Haven, London: Yale University Press, 1982.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Musical Instruments for the Stage in Paintings by Filippino Lippi, Piero Di Cosimo, and Lorenzo Costa." In *Musical Instruments and Their Symbolism in Western Art: Studies in Musical Iconology*, edited by Winternitz, Emanuel. New Haven, London: Yale University Press, 1979, 211-225.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Secular Musical Practice in Sacred Art." *Early Music* 3, no. 3 (1975): 220–6.
- Winternitz, Emanuel, and Lilly Stunzi, *Die schönsten Musikinstrumente des Abendlandes*. Munchen: Keyzersche Verlagsbuchhandlung, 1966.



## Afterword

This collection came together because of the changes foisted on us by Covid-19 as the 2nd KVNM-RMA International Postgraduate Symposium had to be cancelled. It was intended to follow a successful first edition of this symposium in Amsterdam in 2019, which had been organised to create new connections between emerging researchers. The Dutch hospitality was reciprocated by the RMA, who invited KVNM postgraduate researchers to take part in the BFE/RMA Research Students' Conference in 2020. As the next instalment of this collaboration was cancelled, the idea of a publication to celebrate the research submitted formalised. It was also an initiative to offer a platform to early-career musicologists and for forming coalitions among musicology graduates.

The collected papers discuss a wide range of topics: music in cultural policy and charity organisations, identity construction through music theoretical knowledge and through an analysis of authenticity and representation of *The Three-Cornered Hat* performances internationally, critical future possibilities of ludomusicology, the reception of Beethoven in China, the design of fabulous and spectacular instruments and their role in Italian theatrical culture of the sixteenth century, and finally, a thinking through the history and historiography of Russian music. Such varied discussions illustrate the vibrant ongoing discussions taking place in music studies.

John Moore discusses how music theoretical knowledge is wielded or withheld in para-musical framing of some genres and styles. Moore questions how this contributes to identity construction for music fans and musicians.

Jeff Gu discusses ludomusicology and the musicality of video games. To illustrate explorative avenues that can be taken in ludomusicology, *The Legend of Zelda: Breath of the Wild* is analysed for its phenomenological way of immersion in the videogame's setting using Elferen's ALI framework. In doing so, Gu considers how ALI contributes to players' ludic experience.

In *Cultural Policy, Charity Organisations and the Social Integration of Refugees Through Music*, Marthe Holman examines Organised Music projects for refugees through the work of Catching Cultures Orchestra and Orchestre Partout. Holman is critical of ideas that music can be transgressive, having life-transforming social impact. (Neo-)liberal interventions and funding around CCO and OP in the Netherlands are thus discussed.

Drawing on and departing from Richard Taruskin's work on the historiography of Russian music, Céleste Pagniello examines new developments in Russian music since the mid-1980s. How are new narratives built that move away from political Soviet ideology, and how is this reconciled with contemporary Russian values?

Rhiannon Crompton discusses the construction of 'Spanish' music identity through a mapping of *The Three-Cornered Hat* internationally. Considering reviews, Crompton offers a discussion on authenticity, representation and Spanish national identity.

Gangan Tian asks how Beethoven's image is shaped through processes of myth-making. To explore this question, Tian offers an analysis of Chinese portraits of Beethoven and discusses how such portraits impact the Chinese reception of Beethoven, ultimately, to examine the construction of the Chinese Beethoven myth.

Arianna Rigamonti offers historic depictions of instruments and the role of beauty in relation to musical function and sound quality, questioning whether an attempt to occlude the source of the sound of music was an aim in the use of fantastically designed music instruments.

The crucial significance of this collection is that it marks the emergence of a new generation of musicologists who are willing to extend and elaborate on the topics outlined above. Applying formidable critical thought to further musicological discussions, they imagine and create musicology anew. In fact, this collection demonstrates the expanding range of topics discussed in musical research and highlights the potential impact that this work can have on our society. In these difficult times, music—in its largest sense—can contribute to the advancement of humanity and society through knowledge, collaboration and change.

*The Organising Committee*

Liselotte Podda (coordinator)	(KVNM, Utrecht University)
Charissa Granger	(Erasmus University)
Núria Bonet	(RMA, University of Plymouth)
Sio Pan Leong	(RMA, University of Edinburgh)
Tamar Hestrin-Grader	(Rijksmuseum, Amsterdam; ACPA, Universiteit Leiden; KASK & Conservatorium, HOGENT-Howest, Ghent)
Veerle Driessen	(KVNM, Radboud University)

